

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS

SAN ANTONIO DIVISION

NO. SA-95-1215-EP

- - - - - *

JEFF KAPCHE,

Plaintiff

VS.

CITY OF ANTONIO,

Defendant

- - - - - *

DEPOSITION OF DR. EDWARD HORTON, taken on
behalf of the Defendant, taken pursuant to Notice
under the Massachusetts Rules of Civil Procedure,
before Kim M. Romaine, Notary Public and
Shorthand Reporter in and for the Commonwealth of
Massachusetts at the Joslin Diabetes Center, One
Joslin Place, Boston, Massachusetts, on Thursday,
May 25, 2000 commencing at 1:50 p.m.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

2

1 APPEARANCES:

2

3 ON BEHALF OF DEFENDANT:

4

5 LUIS A. MORENO, ESQ.

6 Villarreal, Moreno & Ruis

7 711 Navarro

8 San Antonio, Texas 78205

9 210/228-0871

10

11 ON BEHALF OF PLAINTIFF:

12

13 JOHN GRIFFIN, ESQ.

14 Houston, Marek & Griffin

15 120 Main Place

16 Victoria, Texas 77901

17 361/573-5500

18

19

20

21

22

23

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

3

1

I N D E X

2

DEPOSITION OF: DR. EDWARD HORTON

3

EXAMINATION BY MR. MORENOPAGE 5

4

.....PAGE 128

5

EXAMINATION BY MR. GRIFFINPAGE 103

6

.....PAGE 129

7

8

9

E X H I B I T S

10

No.	Description	Page
-----	-------------	------

11

1	Notice	4
---	--------	---

12

2	Declaration	4
---	-------------	---

13

3	Department of Transportation Document	61
---	---------------------------------------	----

14

4	Curriculum Vita	81
---	-----------------	----

15

16

Exhibit Nos. 1-4 attached to original transcript.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

4

1

P R O C E E D I N G S

2

VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the matter

3

taken by the defense in the matter of Jeff Kapche

4

versus the City of San Antonio held at the Joslin

5

Diabetes Center in Boston Massachusetts on May

6

25th, year 2000 at the time indicated on the

7

video screen. The court reporter is Kim Kelly of

8

O'Brien & Levine and I'm Robert Kramer of Master

9

Video Productions. Counsel will introduce

10

themselves and the court reporter will swear in

11

the deponent.

12

MR. GRIFFIN: I'm John Griffin.

13

I'm from Victoria, Texas. I have the privilege

14

of representing the plaintiff, Mr. Jeff Kapche.

15

MR. MORENO: I'm Luis Moreno. I'm

16

from San Antonio, Texas. I represent the City of

17

San Antonio.

18

THE WITNESS: I'm Edward Horton.

19

I'm a physician here at the Joslin Diabetes

20 Center here in Boston.

21 (Exhibit Nos. 1 and 2 marked
22 for identification).

23 DR. EDWARD HORTON, the witness, having
24 been duly cautioned and sworn, testified upon his

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

5

1 oath as follows:

2 - - - - -

3 EXAMINATION BY MR. MORENO:

4 Q. Good afternoon, Dr. Horton. My name is Luis
5 Moreno, and I'm here on behalf of the City of San
6 Antonio. Please state your name for the record
7 again?

8 A. My name is Edward Shore Horton.

9 Q. And tell us where you reside and what your
10 present occupation is.

11 A. Well, I reside in Brookline, Massachusetts.
12 I am a professor of medicine at Harvard Medical
13 School and vice president and director of
14 clinical research at the Joslin Diabetes Center.

15 Q. Have you had your deposition taken before?

16 A. I have had depositions taken before.

17 Q. Have you testified in court before?

18 A. Yes, I have on one occasion.

19 Q. So you know when your deposition is taken,
20 it's the same as if you were in court; you are
21 under -- you are testifying under oath?

22 A. Yes, I know that.

23 Q. May I have deposition Exhibit Number 1,
24 Doctor, and Number 2? I'm going to show you what

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

6

1 has been marked as deposition Exhibit Number 2
2 and ask if this is your declaration?

3 A. Yes, it is.

4 Q. Okay. Doctor, your primary work is in
5 endocrinology and I guess diabetology?

6 A. Well, endocrinology and metabolism is the
7 official name of the sub-specialty of internal
8 medicine, but I work mostly in the diabetes area
9 and diabetes related diseases.

10 Q. Have you had training or experience in
11 occupational medicine?

12 A. Not training in occupational medicine. I've
13 worked with many people with diabetes who are in
14 different occupations and are familiar with some
15 of the problems they face in their day-to-day

16 life with diabetes as it affects their
17 occupation.

18 Q. Do you have any specific familiarity with
19 the essential job functions and the job demands
20 of a San Antonio Texas police officer?

21 A. Not specifically. Only in a general
22 knowledge that anyone would have as to what
23 police officers do.

24 Q. I had an opportunity this morning to review

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

7

1 your declaration, and I would like to ask you
2 some questions with respect to the same.

3 A. Surely.

4 Q. You make reference to treatment protocol.
5 Would you agree that a treatment protocol ensures
6 capacity to perform or perform the same as --
7 perform a job the same as a non-diabetic? Is
8 that the intent of a treatment protocol for an
9 employee?

10 A. Well, not exactly. When we use the term
11 protocol, what we're really talking about is a
12 treatment regimen that an individual follows in
13 his self-management and self-control of blood

14 sugar levels with his diabetes. It can be
15 informal as in day-to-day activities or it can
16 actually be a formal protocol that is mandated to
17 allow a person to keep his blood sugar within a
18 safe range while he is performing a certain task.
19 So that the term protocol can be used in these
20 two different ways.

21 In a general sense where you're talking
22 about a treatment plan for a self-management or a
23 more formal protocol which would be a defined
24 regimen that a person would go through in order

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

8

1 to maintain their blood sugar in a given range
2 over a certain period of time.
3 Q. But in an employment context, a treatment
4 protocol was designed more to ensure capacity to
5 do work rather than ability to do work, is it
6 not?
7 A. The treatment protocol would not have
8 anything to do with their other qualifications
9 for a job, you know, training for a job. A
10 treatment protocol for somebody with diabetes
11 would be to provide a way to maintain their blood

12 sugar in a controlled range to avoid their blood
13 sugar from being too low or too high so that they
14 would not have any problems in carrying out their
15 normal duties for which they would have to
16 otherwise be qualified.

17 Q. The most significant of which would be
18 incapacity from either hyperglycemia or
19 hypoglycemia?

20 A. That is correct. What you really want to do
21 is to avoid having significant low blood sugar
22 reactions or hypoglycemia which if they occurred
23 could impair judgment or capacity to perform
24 certain tasks. That is really the most

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

9

1 significant problem that one would follow a
2 protocol to avoid in a work situation.

3 Q. When you consider with a type one diabetic
4 the matter of employment, would you agree that
5 you would look obviously to first protect him
6 from any harm and also protect him from harming
7 others?

8 A. Those would be two things that would be of
9 concern. With the safety for the individual, an

10 example might be somebody operating heavy
11 equipment or where they could injury themselves
12 or in a situation where they could injure
13 themselves or harming other people that would be
14 in the environment. Those would be legitimate
15 concerns.

16 Q. And as a physician, of course you recognize
17 some in a job duties involve higher risk work or
18 higher risk work circumstances?

19 A. There are a whole spectrum of jobs that
20 people perform that some would be higher risk to
21 themselves as individuals or higher risk to
22 others if they were not able to carry out their
23 duties.

24 Q. And it's not only the job itself that is

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

10

1 higher risk but also certain circumstances during
2 performance of their duties that are also higher
3 risk?

4 A. Well, jobs vary tremendously from one minute
5 next or one hour to the next if that is what
6 you're meaning. There are certain -- in every
7 job there are some situations which are

8 inherently higher risk than others. I would
9 agree with that.

10 Q. Will a person who is in a job be at higher
11 risk or otherwise be in danger if he for whatever
12 reason is deprived of the means of adjusting his
13 blood sugar level, that is to say, deprived of
14 access to insulin or access to carbohydrates or
15 glucose?

16 A. I think it would depend a lot on the
17 circumstances. An individual who -- for example,
18 if we're talking about somebody who is managing
19 his diabetes by adjusting his insulin dose and
20 his food intake and exercise, these are all
21 things that patients are trained to manage
22 themselves and it adjust themselves. One could
23 conceive of a situation where if you deprived an
24 individual of the ability to do this, there could

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

11

1 be problems. If you locked somebody up for a
2 month and didn't let them eat anything or take
3 any insulin or anything like that, but those
4 would be very unusual circumstances.

5 Q. Hm-mm.

6 A. Reminds me of an example. I did have a
7 chance to meet and interview an individual with
8 insulin treated diabetes who was held hostage
9 after the Iran situation and who was held hostage
10 for about a year or longer and managed quite well
11 with his diabetes even as a hostage over there.

12 Q. Did he have access to insulin?

13 A. With difficulty.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. But he did it. The point is I can conceive
16 of situations where it would be difficult to
17 manage your diabetes if you were put in that kind
18 of a circumstance, but I think it would be the
19 most unusual circumstance.

20 Q. If you're deprived for whatever reason of
21 the means to manage your blood sugar level, would
22 you more likely face danger if you are on an
23 intensive program or a tighter controlled program
24 than if you were on a more conventional

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

12

1 controlled program?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Well, let me ask it this way, isn't the

4 purpose of a tighter control or intensive control
5 program to keep the blood sugar level as nearly
6 normal as possible?

7 A. Well, the goal for treatment of people with
8 diabetes is to try to maintain blood glucose in
9 as close to a normal range as we can in order
10 that their average blood glucose stays fairly
11 well controlled in order to prevent long-term
12 complications of the disease. That does not
13 necessarily mean that a person in a tighter
14 controlled program is at greater risk for wide
15 swings of blood glucose to the low range,
16 hypoglycemic range or the hyperglycemic range.
17 We see that occur in people who are very poorly
18 controlled, you know, not on a tight regimen.
19 And in fact, people who are on what we all an
20 intensive regimen usually are well trained and
21 manage their diabetes quite well. So that -- and
22 many of them have actually fewer wide swings in
23 blood glucose than somebody who was on a less
24 intense regimen.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

1 Q. But the person on a more intense regimen by

2 design seeks to keep the blood sugar level lower
3 as a practice than a person on a more
4 conventional program?

5 A. Well, again, what -- again, what you're
6 trying to do is to keep the blood sugar in a
7 normal range without having excessively low or
8 excessively high blood glucose. So it's the
9 swings in blood glucose that are important. I
10 think it's important to realize that in a normal
11 individual, blood sugar is going up and down
12 throughout the day, and normally it's at its
13 lowest point when you first wake up in the
14 morning having fasted overnight. You eat a meal,
15 it rises, comes back down over a period of two or
16 three hours, you eat again, it goes up, and so
17 blood sugar is always fluctuating throughout the
18 day.

19 What we are trying to do when we train
20 somebody with diabetes to manage themselves is to
21 be able to duplicate as close as possible what
22 the normal pattern of blood sugar, avoiding going
23 too low or going too high. We can actually best
24 achieve that by what people call intensive

1 management regimens, multiple daily injections,
2 using a variety of types of insulin, learning how
3 to eat a diet that will minimize wide
4 fluctuations in blood sugar, learning how to
5 manage changes in physical activity. So the
6 three main things that an individual really has
7 to be trained in and learn about is the effective
8 different types of food, both amounts and types
9 of food, the effects of different types of
10 exercise, duration and intensity of exercise and
11 how to adjust usually two and sometimes three
12 different types of insulin in order to get this
13 normal blood glucose pattern. It's really the
14 less tightly controlled people that have the wide
15 fluctuations in my experience that tend not to
16 balance it so they're too high at some times and
17 too low at other times.

18 Q. Would it be fair to say that the average
19 blood sugar level of a tighter controlled
20 individual would be lower than the average of
21 those with conventional?

22 A. That is what we generally mean. We use a
23 test called the hemoglobin A1C or glycyl
24 hemoglobin to assess what average blood sugar

1 levels are. What this test measures is the
2 amount of glucose that is attached to the
3 hemoglobin in the red cells or the blood, and it
4 gives us an index of what the average blood sugar
5 is during the preceding two to three months.
6 This test has actually become the goal standard
7 for looking at how well controlled the average
8 blood sugar is. It doesn't tell us anything
9 about the swings, if it goes too high or too low.
10 It just gives us sort of a two-month average.

11 Q. And it in and of itself doesn't tell you
12 anything about the next six to nine weeks?

13 A. Well, only in the sense that we test this
14 every -- roughly every three months in our
15 patients. And if somebody is really stable or
16 they may be coming down closer to normal, which
17 means they are coming from higher average blood
18 sugar to a closer to normal average blood sugar
19 or if they're going up, we look at long-term
20 trends. Now, nobody can predict what is going to
21 happen in the future if there are major changes
22 in the pattern, but most people are really quite
23 stable. And one of the things that we are trying
24 to do is to adjust regimens, work with people so

1 that they can bring their hemoglobin A1C into a
2 range that we would consider to minimize their
3 risk for complications.

4 Q. You refer in your declaration to a
5 significant amount of research that is ongoing in
6 diabetes care, but I wanted to ask about the
7 direction of that research and what it still has
8 not achieved. You would agree that it has
9 produced abilities, as you've suggested, to
10 monitor and to test blood sugar levels, but it
11 seems to me that what it's missing is a
12 duplication of the or the restoration, if I may,
13 of the automatic functions that non-diabetics
14 enjoy?

15 A. Well, the amount of research that is going
16 on in the diabetes field covers a huge spectrum
17 of areas. There is a lot of research trying to
18 understand the fundamental causes of the
19 different types of diabetes, type one diabetes
20 and type two diabetes. There is a lot of
21 research going on to understand the causes of the
22 long-term complications of the disease and damage

23 to the eyes, kidneys, nervous system and vascular
24 system. This is leading to better understanding

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

17

1 and development of new treatments and so forth.

2 Now, in type one diabetes, which I presume
3 is the area that you really would like to focus
4 on.

5 Q. Yes.

6 A. There are -- we now have developed methods
7 to actually detect diabetes, the risk for
8 diabetes before diabetes actually occurs in
9 certain individuals. It's an autoimmune disease
10 which means that the body develops antibodies
11 that attack the insulin producing cells in the
12 pancreas called beta cells. We can now measure
13 these antibodies in the blood. That work was
14 actually done here at Joslin several years ago
15 resulting from studies where we are tracking
16 families and family members of people with
17 diabetes and discovered that you can pick up
18 anti-islet cell antibodies, anti-insulin
19 antibodies, a variety of other antibodies that
20 are an indication that the autoimmune process has

21 actually started before there has been enough
22 destruction of the insulin producing cells to
23 actually result in clinical diabetes. You have
24 to have close to 90 percent of the beta cells

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

18

1 actually destroyed before you get diabetes.
2 So this has lead now to a large national
3 multi-centered trial funded by the National
4 Institute of Health to see whether or not we can
5 identify individuals who we know are at very high
6 risk of developing diabetes within the next four
7 to five years and see whether we can actually
8 prevent or significantly delay the development of
9 diabetes. So that is an area of research that is
10 very active and ongoing here and other centers.

11 Another major area of research is the
12 development of islet cell transplantation, being
13 able to take the insulin producing cells from a
14 variety of sources. They can be human cells,
15 cells from animals that are grown in culture and
16 they can even be genetically engineered cells.
17 Cells for example that might be derived from
18 skin, for example and genetically engineer them

19 to produce insulin.

20 Q. These would be introduced into the pancreas?

21 A. No. These cells would be introduced to the
22 body usually not the pancreas. There are
23 different sites that are used. The liver is one
24 area, other organs where they put these cells.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

19

1 And the trick is to be able to transplant these
2 cells, keep them alive and functioning over a
3 long period of time and prevent them from being
4 attacked by the immune system and destroyed. So
5 this is a very active area of research.

6 We are very much involved here at Joslin.
7 We're part of a Harvard University consortium
8 that is attacking this problem, and there is
9 research going on at many centers around the
10 world. So ultimately the hope is to be able to
11 treat people with type one diabetes by eyelet
12 cell transplantation and have these cells
13 function in the body much like the normal insulin
14 producing cells and be self-regulating. So that
15 is another area of research that is very active.

16 Q. These eyelet cell transplantations although

17 are not presently available, are they?
18 A. Well, there was just a recent report from
19 the group in Toronto that they have a number of
20 patients that they are reporting on. There have
21 been a number of previous reports around the
22 world in various centers with eyelet cell
23 transplantation. The problem is -- they work
24 very well, but the problem is to get a long

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

20

1 enough effect. On average, these cells will
2 function with current methods just a few weeks to
3 a few months and then you lose the effect. I
4 think about the longest survival eyelet cell
5 transplant that I am aware of are about two years
6 in duration. But a lot of research work is
7 trying to understand how to -- when these cells
8 are transplanted how to protect them, keep them
9 functioning and so forth. So there is advance in
10 this. A recent report from Toronto reported on
11 half a dozen or so patients that they have
12 transplanted there, and this seemed to be getting
13 good effects. These reports are coming out all
14 the time.

15 Q. Now, this research which allows you to
16 determine that a person is a high risk for, say
17 type, type one diabetes has not produced a means
18 by which you can actually permanently prevent him
19 from --

20 A. No.

21 Q. -- suffering the disease?

22 A. These studies are ongoing. The preliminary
23 results are very promising that they can delay or
24 prevent diabetes, but it's not going to -- it's

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

21

1 not a cure for diabetes once it's developed.
2 Part of the problem is going to be how do you --
3 who do you screen. Currently we are trying to
4 screen individuals we know are at increased risk
5 so they would be first-degree relatives, either a
6 or parent or a sibling or a child of someone that
7 diabetes because we know the chances in that
8 family are greater than just an average. But
9 still the large majority of people that develop
10 type one diabetes, it occurs with no other family
11 history. So, you know, to make this practical,
12 one would then have to go out and screen

13 everybody, and there are people working on
14 inexpensive, rapid screening methods that may
15 some day be practical, but this is not a
16 practical situation at the present time.

17 Q. When you say cure, I think of the massive
18 effort that was made in the thirties, forties and
19 fifties if I recall correctly to cure polio which
20 in fact is well known.

21 A. We prevented it. We didn't cure it. It
22 wasn't a cure.

23 Q. You prevented it altogether?

24 A. Right.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

22

1 Q. I imagine that is the frustration of
2 endocrinologists that you have not found a way to
3 prevent it.

4 A. It's interesting that you bring this up
5 because I was a medical student in the 1950s and
6 experienced as a medical student the last great
7 polio epidemic in this country. They called us
8 as medical students to come in and baby-sit, if
9 you will, all these young people in iron lungs 24
10 hours a day who basically had polio. Your

11 example hits right home for me. I spent many
12 long nights sitting up with young people who were
13 affected in the last polio epidemic, and then
14 when the affective vaccines were developed, it
15 was a tremendous relief that we didn't have
16 polio.

17 Q. I imagine you would feel almost equally
18 ecstatic if you could prevent diabetes in the
19 same way?

20 A. If we could prevent type one diabetes from
21 occurring, I would be ecstatic. I have a son who
22 developed type one with no family history, nobody
23 else in the family, and I would be ecstatic if
24 type one diabetes was no longer around.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

23

1 Q. But certainly in the meantime, it is also
2 desirable to find a means to automatically -- and
3 this may be one in the same thing, to find a
4 means to automatically, quote, break, closed
5 quote, or put a break on the insulin introduction
6 into the blood sugar level?

7 A. I think that we have -- and two, we have a
8 way to actually prevent or, quote, cure the

9 disease. The term cure is somewhat artificial
10 because eyelet cell plantation is not curing the
11 disease. It's just introducing insulin producing
12 cells. But until we have those methodologies,
13 which everyone is working towards and hoping for,
14 a lot of the research is on better ways to
15 simulate what the normal pancreas does in the
16 day-to-day regulations of insulin secretion and
17 other hormones that are involved in this. The
18 eyelets in the pancreas also produce glucagon
19 which is another hormone that regulates blood
20 glucose and that is also affected in people with
21 type one diabetes.

22 What we are really trying to do is to
23 simulate as closely as we can what the normal
24 body does in the day-to-day regulation of blood

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

24

1 glucose. Blood glucose in someone without
2 diabetes is regulated within fairly narrow
3 ranges. The fasting blood sugar is generally
4 between 70 and 110. It goes up above a meal and
5 again it depends on how big the meal is and what
6 is in the meal, but it usually doesn't go up much

7 above 140, 150 milligrams per deciliter and then
8 comes down after that meal and may dip below the
9 fasting level. It may dip down into the sixties,
10 and you usually don't get any symptoms until your
11 blood sugar gets down into the fifties someplace.
12 So this fluctuation of blood sugar in a
13 non-diabetic individual is generally in the range
14 of, at the low point maybe 65, 70 up to about
15 140, 150 range. And so we are trying to develop
16 methodologies and have been very successful in
17 many ways, but not perfect of course, to allow
18 people with diabetes to keep their blood sugars
19 as close as possible to that normal range.
20 Q. Hm-mm. But again, you agree that the
21 self-treatment is necessary or is the next best
22 available means to simulate the non-diabetic's
23 function because of the absence of mechanisms for
24 the automatic production of insulin, the

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

25

1 automatic regulation of blood glucose levels?
2 A. Yes. In my opinion, the critical factor is
3 to have a well educated and well motivated
4 patient who really learns as much as he can about

5 what factors influence his blood sugar and how to
6 appropriately control his blood sugar. And when
7 we train patients and this is really a lot of
8 what we do here is patient education, training
9 and self-management and what we -- for people
10 with type one diabetes who really have to take
11 insulin, we have a number of ways to deliver the
12 insulin that goes all the way from the old
13 fashioned needle and syringe to the use of
14 insulin pens which you can carry around in your
15 pocket so you can take insulin any time you want
16 to or need it or to use insulin pumps. There are
17 a number of very good pumps on the market which
18 are infusion devices which give a continuous
19 fusion of insulin, and you can program them to
20 adjust what we call the basal rate up and down as
21 many as 24 times in a day. Then you control
22 bolus, in other words, give yourself whatever
23 number of units you want to cover meal time. And
24 the things that are really critical for an

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

26

1 individual are, first, being able to monitor
2 their own blood glucose as frequently as they

3 want to or need to, and this currently is done
4 usually with obtaining a drop of blood with a
5 finger prick or there are now some newer systems
6 that you can do it on the forearm or other parts
7 of the body where there are few nerve endings so
8 it's not so uncomfortable. The traditional thing
9 is to get blood from a finger, put the small drop
10 on a little test strip with a meter which then
11 actually determines the blood glucose
12 concentration and gives you the reading usually
13 within a matter of 15, 30 seconds, in that
14 general range. And then you can take that
15 information and use it to adjust what you are
16 going to eat and how much insulin you take and so
17 forth.

18 And the three things that we really train
19 our people are, first of all, to learn how --
20 what their sensitivity is to a unit of insulin.
21 In other words, one unit of insulin will lower
22 the blood sugar by a certain number of milligrams
23 per deciliter. So if you're high, let's say you
24 start off at 200 and you know that one unit will

1 lower you by 30, 2 units by 60, 3 units by 90 or
2 you may be more or less sensitive. So every
3 individual has to learn how sensitive they are to
4 make these corrections if they are too high or
5 too low.

6 The second thing they have to learn is how
7 much insulin to cover a certain amount of
8 carbohydrate in their meal, how many grams of a
9 carbohydrate. It doesn't matter whether sugar or
10 starch or other sorts of things. They are all
11 digested and absorbed as sugars. So it might be
12 one unit for every ten grams of carbohydrate or
13 one unit for every 15 grams of carbohydrate so we
14 teach people to do what we call carbohydrate
15 counting. They know what they are going to eat,
16 they estimate how much carbohydrate they have,
17 and they can judge how many units to take just to
18 cover that meal.

19 And then the third thing they have to learn
20 is the impact of physical exercise. Normally
21 with physical exercise, your muscles take up
22 sugar from the blood and burn it without the use
23 of insulin. You don't need insulin for muscle to
24 take up sugar, but the insulin affects the liver

1 putting out of glucose. So in a non-diabetic
2 individual, there is a very close balance between
3 sugar uptake in the muscle and the liver putting
4 out sugar to balance. So blood sugar doesn't
5 change much with exercise in a non-diabetic
6 individual, but in somebody with diabetes, the
7 insulin levels have to be low in order to allow
8 the liver to put out sugar to balance it. So an
9 individual has to know how to correct high or low
10 sugar, how to take the right amount of insulin to
11 cover what they are going to eat and how to make
12 an adjustment of whether they are going to be
13 exercising or not, and this depends a lot of type
14 of exercise severity and so forth.

15 I work with a lot of diabetic athletes for
16 example. They get very good at this, a marathon
17 runner or tri-athlete.

18 Q. A marathon runner doesn't need a whole lot
19 of insulin, does he?

20 A. When you are running a marathon, you don't
21 need a lot of insulin. And this is the normal
22 response. We have many marathon runners who can
23 maintain their blood sugar in a very close range.

24 Q. It seems like a decent alternative to taking

1 a greater quantity of insulin?

2 A. People who are physically well trained and
3 are good athletes, generally their insulin
4 requirements are significantly lower than
5 somebody who is a couch potato. That is very
6 true. I've actually worked with people with type
7 one diabetes who have competed, for example, in
8 the Hawaiian Iron Man. That is a hard enough if
9 you don't have diabetes, right? People with type
10 one diabetes are able to complete Hawaiian Iron
11 Mans.

12 Q. But all these people and particularly those
13 who are on the intense program or who are very
14 highly motivated are on a program that is
15 continuously; you are continuously trying to
16 recreate regulation of the blood sugar levels
17 that are normal levels?

18 A. There is no holiday.

19 Q. There is no holiday?

20 A. No holiday. If you have type one diabetes,
21 you have to be very dedicated to what you are
22 doing. You have to check your blood glucose
23 usually several times a day, you are making

24 decisions practically before every meal as to

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

30

1 what your blood sugar is, how much insulin to
2 take, you may be adjusting what you eat and you
3 have to make adjustments for exercise. So it
4 takes a lot of knowhow, a lot of dedication to do
5 it and it's not fun.

6 Q. And it's elementary to say that absent this
7 daily patient intervention, you are constantly at
8 risk of being unregulated in your blood sugar?

9 A. If a person doesn't pay attention,
10 absolutely. Again, I'd just like to reemphasize
11 the need for having the knowledge. So it's
12 really the education and the training and
13 self-management to be able to make these
14 decisions throughout the day, and you have to be
15 well motivated. So you have to really want to do
16 it. And I think failure of regulation is often
17 due too either a lack of the knowledge that you
18 have and or a lack of motivation. You know, we
19 see situations where people do lose their
20 motivation. I mean, dealing with teenagers is
21 not an easy job. I can tell you that.

22 Q. You mentioned --

23 A. I could give you some examples of difficult
24 situations. Mix drugs and type one diabetes for

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

31

1 example, not fun. Teenagers, young women with
2 anorexia nervosa or eating disorders, they learn
3 that if they don't take their insulin that is a
4 good way to lose weight. There's a number of
5 really tough situations.

6 Q. In your statement on Page 4 you're talking
7 about a particular product that you refer to as
8 an implanted blood glucose monitor. I was just
9 curious, you say that that works, that can work
10 for 72 hours. And the question that I have is,
11 is that designed for continuous use 72 hours upon
12 72 hours or just occasional use?

13 A. I don't think it's going to be -- going to
14 find this in continuous use. I think it will be
15 occasional use. This is a system that has been
16 developed by the MiniMed people who are one of the
17 major manufacturers of insulin pumps. They have
18 been working for a number of years on continuous
19 glucose monitoring systems. What this is is a

20 small needle like apparatus that you insert under
21 the skin. It has a little disc like thing with a
22 needle sticking down, then a little wire which
23 then goes to a recorder that you would wear on
24 your belt for example. What this does is it

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

32

1 gives over 72 hour period a continuous monitoring
2 of the blood glucose level. To me where this is
3 -- and then you can download this and look at the
4 patterns. Where this is really most useful is in
5 looking at patterns of blood glucose. For
6 example, if you have someone who is on an insulin
7 pump or taking several injections a day and you
8 really want to find out just what the blood sugar
9 is doing between the times you would normally
10 measure it because let's say you're even
11 measuring four, five, six times a day, there is a
12 lot of time in the day when you are not measuring
13 it. So you want to find out how high somebody
14 goes after a meal, do they go too low in the
15 middle of the night when they're asleep. And so
16 I think the real use of this is an occasional use
17 to get a 72 hour continuous blood glucose

18 profile, then you can go back and look at, then
19 make some adjustments in their basal insulin or
20 their pump regimen to try to smooth out, then you
21 could recorrect them again after you made the
22 changes to see whether what you have done
23 actually works. It's not something that I
24 anticipate patients that I work with just doing

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

33

1 as a continuous way to monitor their glucose to
2 substitute for finger-stick glucoses.

3 There is a lot of interest and the thing
4 that patients also ask is when are we going to
5 have a truly non-evasive glucose monitoring
6 system. There is a number of companies that have
7 been working systems that use infrared light or
8 ultraviolet light that signs on the skin and it
9 gets absorbed in the spectrum of glucose and then
10 can give you reading on glucose. But these are
11 -- technologically there's a lot of problems,
12 they are not that accurate, you have to calibrate
13 them to each individual. We are doing some
14 research with some of these systems, but they are
15 not ready yet for general use. So I tell all of

16 my patients you still have to stick your finger
17 unfortunately.
18 Q. You refer in Paragraph 11 of your
19 declaration to Humalog, and you discuss it in a
20 context of covering a meal. I assume you mean in
21 the case of Humalog being a fast or very fast
22 acting insulin you mean covering a meal promptly.
23 Why is covering a meal important?
24 A. Well, this Humalog has been a major advance.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

34

1 It's only one of many new insulins that we have,
2 but the treatment of somebody with type one to
3 replace it, it's two concepts. One is to replace
4 what we call basal insulin which would be the
5 amount of insulin that would be coming out just
6 under basal conditions overnight or between meals
7 or if you skip a meal. You know, the fasting
8 levels. And the other is what we call bolus
9 insulin which is trying to reproduce what the
10 pancreas would normally secrete in response to
11 food intake. So you eat something and almost
12 immediately there is a burst of the insulin that
13 comes out and then it falls off over time, and

14 then it goes up very rapidly and then it begins
15 to fall and the blood sugar rises and then falls
16 down. So what you want is to cover a meal,
17 meaning to give a very rapid acting, short acting
18 insulin which is absorbed rapidly since you are
19 giving it by injection and then doesn't last too
20 long because you want it to cover that food but
21 then be gone so you don't have too much insulin
22 around three, four hours after the meal when you
23 don't need it because that could be associated
24 with going too low.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

35

1 We had in the past the short acting insulin
2 has been what is called regular insulin which is
3 normal insulin. It's absorbed a little bit
4 slowly because when it comes out of the bottle
5 it's in what we call a hexamer which is six
6 insulin molecules stuck together in a crystal.
7 You inject it, it has to break down from this
8 hexamer to a dimer or just two molecules which
9 then get absorbed and then they disassociate into
10 the single insulin molecule. Now, this takes a
11 period of time so somebody taking regular insulin

12 generally has to allow 30 to 45 minutes for this
13 process to occur. So we tell people to take
14 their insulin injection 30 to 45 minutes before
15 they have a meal. Well, first of all, that
16 rarely happens. People don't do that. It's just
17 not convenient. It doesn't work. You are going
18 out to dinner and you are not sure when to take
19 your insulin because you don't know when your
20 food is going to arrive. You are not even sure
21 what you're going to eat, and you haven't even
22 figured out what is going to be in front of you.
23 So Humalog insulin is a absorbed -- it's a
24 modification of the insulin molecule so it

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

36

1 doesn't form these hexamers and it's rapidly
2 absorbed. So you inject it and you got the
3 effect within minutes.

4 It's just revolutionized the life of people.
5 They don't have to take it until the food is
6 right in front of them and then they can do their
7 carbohydrate counting, they know that they are
8 going to eat, they know they are going to eat
9 within a couple of minutes and so they can check

10 just take their bolus. And then the other thing
11 is that it -- regular insulin lasts longer than
12 it should because again, because of the
13 absorption and clearance is longer and slower.
14 So this stuff is much more like the pancreas
15 normally does. It's rapidly absorbed and gone
16 more quickly.

17 Q. If you're eating your largest meal of the
18 day and you injected Humalog, this rapidly acting
19 insulin or let's say one or the other Humalog or
20 the regular acting, short acting insulin and if
21 your meal has been served to you and you've
22 injected one or the other and you are that person
23 in the American Embassy in Iran and they burst in
24 your on meal, you prefer at that moment to have

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

37

1 injected regular versus Humalog?

2 A. You would prefer to have something to eat I
3 think.

4 Q. You want to hope that the hostage takers are
5 not hungry and take your food away?

6 A. Yes. I think it's obvious you'd give
7 yourself a dose of rapidly acting insulin if in

8 anticipation of having something to eat. It's
9 much better to be able to do it right before you
10 eat than it is to try to anticipate by 30 to 45
11 minutes.

12 Q. A lot of these developments in insulin and
13 care really address the notion of keeping your
14 blood sugar level from going up in such a way as
15 to produce diabetic complications?

16 A. Yes, and also to prevent low blood sugar
17 because of the timing. It's like the old saying,
18 timing in life is everything. The timing of
19 coordinating your insulin with your food intake
20 and the changes in your blood sugar is really
21 critical. So if your insulin is too low and too
22 late, you may go too high after a meal. If it's
23 too late and you have too much insulin four,
24 five, six hours after a meal, you can go too low.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

38

1 So it's really trying to match the insulin with
2 the changes in food intake and the need for the
3 insulin which is what your normal pancreas does
4 without you even thinking about it.

5 Q. In discussing the matter with Dr. Ralph

6 DeFranco in his deposition, he suggested to my
7 surprise that having insulin to cover a meal was
8 of a higher priority than having a meal to cover
9 insulin. What do make of that?

10 A. I think that the -- this is the strategy of
11 what we are trying to do is to allow people to
12 lead a normal life and do what they want to do.
13 So this is -- it's a paradigm. In the old days,
14 in the beginning, people were trained to adjust
15 their food intake, to adjust their exercise, to
16 adjust their insulin. Basically they were tried
17 kind of to their insulin regimen. Now the whole
18 idea is to try to balance what you take for
19 insulin, what you take for food, what you do for
20 exercise to allow you to flexibility to do
21 whatever you want to do to, skip meals, to take
22 extra meals between times, to exercise when you
23 wants to. And again, I bring up the athlete
24 paradigm because I work a lot of athletes, and

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

39

1 I've always been very much interested in athletic
2 performance of diabetics. I tell people that you
3 can do anything you want. I've worked with

4 people who are professional athletes, I've worked
5 with people who are just weekend warriors, if you
6 will. And people really can learn how to balance
7 their insulin, their food intake, their physical
8 activity so that they can do these things.

9 One of the -- I used to say the only thing I
10 worried about somebody attempting would be
11 something like scuba diving. And I made this
12 statement at an international diabetic athletes
13 association congress, and immediately a group of
14 about ten people jumped up in the back of the
15 room and started yelling at me and telling me
16 that I was crazy, that they scuba dive all the
17 time and so I got interested in it. We actually
18 got Patty to -- you didn't used to be able to get
19 certified as a diver if you took insulin, but we
20 got that changed and you can now get certified.
21 We have also worked with divers to get the latest
22 information for people with diabetes who are
23 divers. So that's just an example of where even
24 I thought at one time there may be certain things

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

1 you shouldn't do, I found out that there are

2 people out there doing it and they figured out
3 how to do it and they do it just fine and it
4 works well.

5 Q. You're referring in your declaration to
6 employment protocol. I think you said in
7 addition to the technological advances, in recent
8 years there have been a number of employment
9 protocols developed for people with diabetes who
10 take insulin.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What type of work have these employment
13 protocols been developed?

14 A. Well, I can just tell you my own personal
15 experience because I have worked with some of
16 these groups. The first group that I worked with
17 -- I was part of a blue ribbon committee that was
18 put together by FAA to work with the issue of
19 air-traffic controllers. Under the Regan
20 administration it was decided that any
21 air-traffic controller that was taking insulin
22 should not do that. They were taken off the job.
23 Many of them had been on the job for many years
24 with no problems, but they were removed and

1 assigned to other duties. So I was part of a
2 committee that sat down and reviewed the job
3 requirements, actually visited the FAA, got to go
4 into the master control room which was
5 interesting. Talk about 1,000 points of light.
6 It has every airplane in the air in the United
7 States on one big screen. So I spent a lot of
8 time learning about what air-traffic controllers
9 do, what the requirements are, and we came up
10 with a protocol to get the air-traffic
11 controllers back to work which involved checking
12 their blood sugar before they went on duty, at
13 certain periods of time during the course of
14 their work, having appropriate reactions if their
15 blood sugar was too high or too low and we
16 allowed safety margins. I think we set the lower
17 limit at 100 rather than 65 or 70 and I think we
18 set the upper limit at around 400. So we
19 developed this protocol which then was reviewed
20 and actually put into effect, and the air-traffic
21 controllers went back to work. So that's one
22 example where you could do that.

23 The second thing that I worked on was
24 another panel that was convened by FAA to look at

1 waivers for third-class airmen or private pilots
2 basically, and we reviewed with the FAA the
3 requirements for what a pilot does to take off
4 and landing and flying and all these things. So
5 we actually developed a protocol that would allow
6 people to do that. The big difference between
7 the FAA and the pilots was the FAA, there's
8 always -- you're in a group setting and there is
9 a supervisor who can kind of look over your
10 shoulder and make sure you do it, but if you're
11 private, you're on the honor system, right? So
12 it's kind of worked well. And I think that the
13 FAA reviewed all that, put it out for public
14 comment, and I think that that's been implemented
15 now.

16 The third area has been in the area of
17 commercial vehicle drivers, and this has been
18 kind of an on again, off again sort of program.
19 There was a test or a pilot waiver program,
20 research project, if you will, to look at
21 interstate truck drivers who take insulin, and
22 they've collected the data from that. I haven't
23 seen the absolute final report, but my
24 understanding is that they found that people who

1 were taking insulin well controlled actually had
2 a lower accident rate than average in those
3 studies.

4 And the Federal Highway Authority is
5 actually studying now, coming up with what their
6 final protocol and recommendation is going to be
7 and actually served as a consultant. Last fall I
8 went down to Washington, was invited to be part
9 of a panel to review the situation and make
10 recommendations and so I did that. I think that
11 it's not -- they have not come up with their
12 final decision yet as how they are going to
13 handle that. But those are three areas.

14 I've also had patients of mine who are
15 police officers. I have one individual that is a
16 police officer. I've worked with other people
17 who are, you know, potentially high risk
18 occupations. While you wouldn't consider a high
19 risk occupation, I consider my work with diabetic
20 athletes to let me know what you can do. And I
21 think to me, working with the athletes has really
22 been very instructive because you take first of

23 all, there is generally high motivation, people
24 are checking themselves, some of them many times

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

44

1 a day. They learn how to make the changes on a
2 rest day, a training day or a competition day,
3 all of which are very different situations so
4 they really learn how to deal with changing
5 situations. I think I've come away realizing
6 that a well motivated individual can do almost
7 anything they want.

8 Q. In consulting with the FHA on the commercial
9 vehicle driver waiver program, did you have an
10 opportunity to review the specific requirements
11 of what a commercial vehicle driver does?

12 A. Not in great detail. I mean, we were given
13 background information about long-distance hauls,
14 you know, how many hours you have to be up and
15 things like that and also some of the physical
16 requirements that you have in terms of possibly
17 loading and unloading trucks and things like
18 that, but I wouldn't say that we spent a great
19 deal of time learning all the fine points of it.
20 Not to the same extent that I learned the fine

21 points of what you have to do as an air-traffic
22 controller or as a pilot.

23 Q. You feel that even now, even today, months
24 later you could articulate what an air-traffic

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

45

1 controller or a pilot does?

2 A. Well, this is six or seven years ago, but I
3 think there the focus was on mental alertness and
4 quick response time and managing multiple
5 different situations but not so much physically
6 demanding work obviously, but it's really most
7 mental alertness and attention to detail. I
8 think it's almost the same thing with the pilots.
9 It's really the risky times of being a pilot are
10 takeoff and landing but you have got to -- so
11 it's really certain times that you have to make
12 sure that your blood sugar is in the limits where
13 you function completely normally.

14 The only other experience I've had in this
15 area from a kind of legal point of view -- I just
16 might mention it -- is I have reviewed some -- at
17 least one situation of a flight attendant,
18 airline stewardess or flight attendant who had

19 type one diabetes and there was some question by
20 the employing airline as to whether or not a
21 flight attendant would -- taking insulin would be
22 prepared to act in an emergency situation. So I
23 was involved in some discussions about that as
24 well.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

46

1 So there are a number of these situations
2 that come up all the time in terms of the
3 employment environment, and the position that I
4 feel very strongly about is that it really
5 involves an individual assessment of the person,
6 how well controlled they are, how well educated
7 they are, do they have any physical complications
8 or things that would preclude them from doing a
9 job. Obviously there are certain things that --
10 there could be physical limitations to doing a
11 job. You have to be meet all the other
12 requirements. But in terms of blood glucose
13 control, one with a well educated and well
14 trained person and who is well motivated can
15 really avoid these risks of hypoglycemia or
16 severe prolonged hyperglycemia.

17 Q. So you have consulted in the air-traffic
18 controller circumstances, pilot circumstances, to
19 a lesser degree with commercial vehicle drivers.
20 I know what I was going to ask you. Was that
21 flight attendant's circumstances a matter in
22 litigation or --

23 A. Matter of litigation, yes, it was.

24 Q. Have you ever consulted with respect to the

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

47

1 department of employment protocol in any type of
2 law enforcement work?

3 A. No, I have not.

4 Q. I --

5 A. Prior to this.

6 Q. I understand. You mentioned you have a
7 patient that is type one diabetes who is in law
8 enforcement. What -- if you don't mind telling
9 me, what department does he person work for?

10 A. He is a police officer in one of the
11 regional cities here.

12 Q. I see. And does that regional city have any
13 type of employment protocol that it imposes on
14 your patient?

15 A. No. Not a formal protocol like check your
16 sugar now, eat this sort of thing now, no, they
17 do not. This is -- I've just worked with him.
18 He's a very highly motivated, well educated
19 individual and I've just taken care of him and I
20 know that he's able to carry out his duties as a
21 police officer.

22 Q. So insofar as a safety issue is concerned,
23 your involvement is on the patient side as opposed
24 to the police function side?

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

48

1 A. That's right.

2 Q. You mentioned the Department of
3 Transportation commercial driver license
4 situation. I understand that at some point in
5 time during the nineties they changed -- the
6 department changed its policy to allow type one
7 diabetics to perform non-commercial driving. Are
8 you familiar with that change?

9 A. No. I'm not sure what you're referring to
10 there. What do you mean by non-commercial?

11 Q. Well, apparently they have a distinction
12 between one type of driving and the other. I

13 imagine it has to do with what kind of vehicle
14 that you drive.
15 A. I'm not aware of that. You know, the
16 distinctions that I have generally been aware of
17 or without knowing the details are one can get an
18 ordinary driver's license if you have type one
19 diabetes to drive your personal car or whatever.
20 I believe that one of the big distinctions is
21 whether you're a driver in interstate commerce or
22 locally. So that is basically the difference,
23 local state regulations or local regulations
24 versus federal regulations. So the only area

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

49

1 that I have been involved with has been in the
2 federal area which really has to do with
3 interstate commerce commercial driver's licenses,
4 but I don't know any subgrades of that.
5 Q. You mention, Dr. Horton -- well, you mention
6 studies and you mentioned a Department of Justice
7 action in Arizona and North Carolina. Are you
8 aware of any other studies or Department of
9 Justice rulings compelling the employment of type
10 one diabetics or the use of employment protocols

11 in any other type of higher risk work?

12 A. Not beyond the ones I've mentioned to you

13 already. I mean, the ones that I'm aware of that

14 I have been personally involved with.

15 Q. Yes, sir. In Paragraph 13 of your

16 declaration, Doctor, you say that, "As a result

17 of the development and improvement of diabetes

18 technology and treatment protocols, people with

19 diabetes are much better able to self-monitor,

20 self-control and self-treat their diabetes and

21 can be anticipated to lead long and healthy lives

22 without long term diabetic complications." When

23 you say better able, essentially a diabetic today

24 appears to be better able to do or undertake the

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

50

1 same basic treatment steps that he undertook 10

2 or and 15 years ago?

3 A. Yeah. But the tools are much better.

4 Q. The tools are better but the actions

5 necessary are still the same?

6 A. The actions in the sense are the same in

7 that a person has to -- if they have type one

8 diabetes, they require insulin and the way it's

9 delivered now is either by injection or with a
10 pump. It's all different ways to inject it,
11 whether you use a needle and syringe or a pen or
12 continuous infusion device, what have you. So
13 yes, people have to take insulin from outside.
14 The people now can adjust -- I think frankly the
15 biggest improvement of all has been the
16 self-glucose monitoring.

17 Back several years ago we had people
18 collecting their urine and boiling it to see if
19 it turned colors depending on how much glucose
20 was in it, and then we finally got dipsticks that
21 you'd dip in it and it would turn colors. That
22 dipstick told you that there was sugar in your
23 urine and a lot or a little. It didn't tell you
24 anything about what your blood sugar was doing

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

51

1 when and these ups and downs and it was always
2 after the fact because what your urine was
3 measuring what was in your bladder which was what
4 was in your blood a few hours ago. It was -- it
5 really it helped a little bit, but being able to
6 actually do a finger stick, see what your blood

7 sugar is and then make a judgment about insulin,
8 how much you're going to take, what you're going
9 to eat, whether you have to get your sugar a
10 little bit higher if you are going to go out for
11 a five-mile run and if you went a little cushion.
12 These are the judgements that are now possible.
13 So it's totally different ball game now than it
14 was 10 years ago or 15 years ago. It's basically
15 because of technology.

16 Q. But 15 years ago you could make the same
17 judgments. Perhaps you couldn't make them as --
18 would you agree that it was really the ability to
19 self-monitor that changed everything?

20 A. I think so, Yes, plus the fact you have much
21 better insulins now. We have very short rapid
22 acting insulin. We also have better basal
23 insulin. The FDA has just approved, and it's not
24 on the market yet but will be soon, a new basal

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

52

1 insulin which is a long acting, once a day
2 injection that people will be able to take at
3 bedtime.

4 Q. You said injection?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. The same as --

7 A. It's an insulin injection, but it's just
8 very predictable, long acting 24 hour insulin for
9 the basal treatment instead of twice a day
10 insulin. So all the time we are getting
11 technologically better insulins. We are getting
12 more convenient and more rapid ways to measure
13 blood sugar. We are getting better ways to
14 administer the insulin. So these are just
15 technological advances. But you're right, it's
16 all still based on you have to take insulin, you
17 have to know what you're eating, you have to know
18 what exercise does. So it doesn't get away from
19 the hands on, day-to-day involvement.

20 Q. Going back to your police officer, you have
21 one police officer --

22 A. That I can think of just off the top of my
23 head.

24 Q. Do you recall treating any other law

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

53

1 enforcement type person recently?

2 A. Not recently, no.

3 Q. But say you've --

4 A. Well, we're talking about type one diabetes

5 specifically?

6 Q. Yes.

7 A. Not with type one. I have other people. I

8 just happened to think of one other individual

9 who works in the drug enforcement area which is

10 probably higher risk than being a police officer

11 but he has type two diabetes.

12 Q. I see. Okay. Staying on your police

13 officer a little bit longer, did you have an

14 opportunity to learn from him about his actual

15 day-to-day experience? Could you tell me for

16 example whether he has ever fired his weapon

17 while on duty?

18 A. Well, I can't tell you that detail. I mean,

19 I talk to all of my patients obviously and find

20 out what their day-to-day life is like, and I

21 know he is a patrol officer, he responds to

22 emergencies, he gets called. Whether or not he's

23 actually fired a weapon, I don't know.

24 Q. You mentioned drug enforcement work being

1 higher risk than perhaps police work.

2 A. Well, that is my guess.

3 Q. I'm glad that we're in a position to guess
4 and not really know. Assuming that to be the
5 case, is it desirable to have an employment
6 protocol for a type one diabetic in those
7 circumstances?

8 A. Well, you know, with my opinion I think that
9 a well trained and highly motivated patient is
10 going to follow his own regimen and the regimen
11 needs to be individualized a great deal. The
12 problem with a protocol is it says you do A,
13 then you do B and if B is such and such, you do
14 C and that is almost too rigid for me. I really
15 think that highly a educated patient, well
16 trained makes decisions himself or herself based
17 on blood glucose readings, anticipated exercise,
18 anticipated food intake, correction for blood
19 sugar if it's too high and these things you can't
20 write in a protocol. You can't -- it's not a
21 cookbook operation.

22 Q. And they're all designed to keep the blood
23 sugar level within an acceptable range?

24 A. So I think what do if you write a protocol

1 is basically to write a guideline and say you
2 should keep your blood sugar in such and such a
3 range. And I do think that it's perfectly
4 reasonable to have a safety cushion, if you will.
5 I mean, we did this with our patients -- I mean
6 the people for the air-traffic controllers and
7 the pilots saying that you shouldn't get your
8 blood sugar below 100. If it is below 100, here
9 is what you do, you take something to eat. The
10 other kind of protocol if you want to call it a
11 protocol is you have food available with you at
12 times so that you can take food if you need it.
13 Everybody is trained to pick up symptoms if their
14 blood sugar is getting low and taught how to take
15 appropriate action for it. And all of these
16 things I would rather call guidelines rather than
17 rigid protocol. To me, a protocol almost implies
18 a very rigid thing and I think what you need is
19 flexibility. You need guidelines.

20 Q. It certainly puts a greater responsibility
21 on the patient?

22 A. It does, yes.

23 Q. As opposed to the employer insofar as --

24 A. But when you think about it --

1 Q. Risk is a concern?

2 A. But when you think about it, it's a little
3 bit unfair to put the responsibility upon the
4 employer and say, you have to follow this guy
5 around and make sure he's doing this all the
6 time. It really should be on the patient's
7 responsibility or the person's responsibility.

8 Q. I'd like to discuss a little bit more the
9 experience that you have with the -- actually,
10 experiences that you had with the Federal
11 Aviation Administration. If I understand you
12 correctly, you were first on a blue ribbon panel
13 of distinguished endocrinologists that worked
14 with the matter of or the matter of air-traffic
15 controllers with type one diabetes and then also
16 considered the matter of issuing of license to
17 pilots, if I understand correctly, third-class
18 airmen. Let's talk about the service that you
19 had with respect to the pilots. If I understand
20 correctly, that was a several year process, was
21 it not?

22 A. Well, at least a couple of years that I was
23 involved with it.

24 Q. But the FAA considered it, if I understand

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

57

1 correctly, from 1991 to 1996?

2 A. Well, my involvement was in 1991 to 1993, if
3 I remember correctly, when they were really
4 beginning to consider this, and we met and
5 developed some guidelines for them. Then the
6 process involved coming up with their own
7 guidelines, publishing them in the record for
8 comment and this whole -- I really was not very
9 much involved from that point on. So it was
10 really next development of the original
11 recommendations that they then considered and
12 then they published and went through the whole
13 commentary period and finally came up with their
14 final thing. So I guess I was probably in early
15 but didn't follow it all the way through.

16 Q. But you were chairperson of that -- chairman
17 of the committee?

18 A. Yes, I was.

19 Q. And --

20 A. It was also at the time that I was making my
21 move from University of Vermont to here at

22 Harvard and that was 1993 when I came down here
23 so I was kind of trying to finish that up and get
24 on with my new thing so I didn't really have much

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

58

1 involvement after that point.

2 Q. Okay. Did your committee prepare a report
3 for the FAA?

4 A. I did, yes.

5 Q. What recommendations did the committee make?

6 A. Well, we made an -- I was actually last
7 night trying to find a file to review the
8 details, but I couldn't find it. I think it's
9 packed away in Burlington, Vermont someplace. I
10 can summarize in general terms. It may not be
11 exactly 100 percent. The recommendations, first
12 of all, were that the person had to have a
13 regular physical examination and pass all the
14 physical requirements, eyesight, neuropathy, you
15 know, they had to be in good health so they met
16 all the general physical requirements that you'd
17 require for third-class airman's license.

18 The second thing had to do with the need for
19 having documented a training program in

20 self-management, good education programs, being
21 trained in self-monitoring of glucose, being
22 trained in being able to recognize and take
23 appropriate action for symptoms that might be
24 associated with low blood sugars.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

59

1 And then we set up a protocol that we felt
2 would ensure that an individual would maintain
3 their blood sugar in the range of approximately
4 100 to 400 milligrams per decaliter. This
5 involved the requirement that they would do a
6 finger-stick glucose before they were getting
7 ready to take off, and if it was below 100 that
8 they would take something to eat and that they
9 would wait for 30 minutes, then recheck to make
10 sure that it was in the right range. Likewise,
11 if they were above the upper limit of 400 that
12 they would either wait if it was just matter of
13 being too high after a meal or they would take
14 extra insulin to bring it down depending on the
15 circumstance and recheck. So at the time that
16 they were ready to take off, which is considered
17 a critical time, that they would be in that range

18 of 100 to 400.

19 Then we recommended periodically and I can't
20 recall the exact finding, but like every two to
21 four hours or something like that while they are
22 actually up flying and that they would also check
23 when they were getting prepared to land to make
24 sure they were in the right range.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

60

1 So it was those kinds of protocol, if you
2 will, for checking blood sugar periodically,
3 either bringing down appropriately or bringing it
4 up if it was below 100. And we picked 100 to be
5 a safety range realizing that you don't get
6 symptoms or impaired function until you get down
7 below 60 so we thought we had a pretty safe
8 cushion in there for operating range and still
9 was in a reasonable range for somebody with
10 diabetes. We do not want people walking around
11 in poor control of their diabetes so this was not
12 an unreasonable range. So this was the
13 principles of the protocol that we worked on.

14 Q. How many endocrinologists worked for your
15 committee?

16 A. I think we had about half a dozen.
17 Q. And that was the entire composition of the
18 committee?
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. And was the recommendations made unanimous?
21 A. Yes. I drafted them, sent them around to
22 the committee members for comment. There were
23 comments collected, I incorporated the comments,
24 then sent -- made a report. And it was basically

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

61

1 just exactly that. It was a report to the FAA.
2 And then they actually may the decision as to
3 what to do next.
4 Q. Did they accept your recommendations?
5 A. Basically they accepted our recommendations.
6 I think in the first version of what they did,
7 they actually proposed these recommendations for
8 all the pilots, class one, class two, class
9 three, and we had made our recommendations
10 specifically for class-three airman or private
11 pilot's license. So then what happened after
12 that with public comment and where they ended up,
13 I think I'd have to go back to the record and

14 look, but I have not really tracked it.
15 Q. Have you read the policy statements that the
16 FAA issued with respect to this matter?
17 A. At what time, what date would that be?
18 Q. Let me pull a copy out.
19 A. I lost track.
20 (Exhibit No. 3 marked
21 for identification).
22 BY MR. MORENO:
23 Q. Glance at deposition Exhibit Number 3 if you
24 would.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

62

1 A. What would you like me to look at?
2 Q. Well, on the first page about a little
3 further down from where you were reading it says
4 Action: Policy Statement. Do you agree that
5 that means that this is a policy statement of the
6 Federal Aviation Administration; is that a fair
7 statement?
8 A. Well, it sounds like it. It says it's a
9 summary. It says --
10 Q. Well, summary is a summary of the policy.
11 A. "This document announces the new policy of

12 the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA)
13 regarding individuals with insulin treated
14 diabetes mellitus (ITDM) who apply for airman
15 medical certification. It also addresses
16 comments received concerning this policy as
17 requested in a December 1994 federal register
18 notice. The new policy will permit special
19 issuance of third-class airman medical
20 certificates to certain ITDM individuals who meet
21 selection criteria and who successfully comply
22 with an FAA approved monitoring protocol." So
23 this is now I a document that summarizes what
24 finally happened after all of this work that we

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

63

1 were doing and it actually looks like its
2 affective date is December 23, 1996.
3 Q. Thank you, Doctor. If you didn't mind
4 glancing through it, just through the document
5 just to be certain that it appears to be what you
6 just suggested it is.
7 A. Okay. It says the FAA published a notice in
8 the Federal Register in late 1994 of its intent
9 to consider a policy change and opened docket

10 number 26493 and invited comment to it on a
11 medical evaluation and monitoring protocol for
12 possible use as the basis of the policy change.

13 Q. That appears to be the background --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- of what occurred?

16 A. Right. And response to comments received
17 from the 1994 notice and to comments from a 1991
18 petition of the American Diabetes Association.
19 That is how this whole thing got Association.

20 Q. And it was the American Diabetes Association
21 petition that initiated the consideration by the
22 FAA?

23 A. Exactly.

24 Q. Okay.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

64

1 A. Which is true. Then it defines first-class
2 medical certificate is required and in
3 third-class it defines that a third-class is a
4 private class, and that is what this applies to.

5 Q. Now, there is a distinction between the
6 Federal Aviation Administrator and the Federal
7 Air Surgeon, is there not?

8 A. Well, the Federal Air Surgeon I guess is the
9 medical person responsible.

10 Q. Is --

11 A. They work closely together.

12 Q. And the Federal Air Surgeon is the person
13 that you worked together with?

14 A. I think we were pulled together by the FAA,
15 but I think the report was addressed to Federal
16 Air Surgeon if I remember correctly. I would
17 have to going back to check.

18 Q. But it was the FAA, the larger
19 administration that showed you around?

20 A. Yes, and educated us. We actually had - we
21 learned what pilots do from, but we did interact
22 with the officers of the Federal Air Surgeon.

23 Q. Yes.

24 A. I had lost track of this and hadn't seen it

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

65

1 and to see if it comes up close to what I told
2 you and what my recollection of what we
3 recommended. Here we go, "In order to provide
4 an adequate basis for an individual medical
5 determination, the person with ITDM," that

6 term --

7 Q. What page are you reading from, Doctor?

8 A. Page 8. The term -- I should explain the
9 term ITDM. Insulin treated diabetes mellitus is
10 distinguished from type one or somebody with type
11 two who requires insulin because people with type
12 two diabetes may also require insulin. So this
13 really covered both type one diabetes and type
14 two diabetic patients who were on insulin.

15 Q. The concern was dependance on insulin?

16 A. That's right. The focus was taking insulin.
17 Not whether you were a type one or type two
18 diabetic but did you require insulin. So that
19 was the focus of this. If I can just go ahead.

20 Q. Sure. Go ahead, Doctor.

21 A. They wanted copies of all medical records,
22 copies of reports of any accidents, reports of a
23 complete medical examination by an
24 endocrinologist or other diabetes specialist

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

66

1 physician. It was acceptable to the Federal Air
2 Surgeon, and that was an important point that
3 this couldn't be their family doctor. This had

4 to be somebody who specialized in diabetes that
5 they had to go see.

6 Two measurements of glycated hemoglobin or
7 hemoglobin A1C with the first one at least 90
8 days prior, and this was to show stability. You
9 know, you want two different values so the person
10 couldn't be going from good to bad, bad to good.
11 The general idea is you want people who are
12 stable. That was the purpose of that.

13 A detailed report of their insulin doses
14 including types and what their diet was.

15 Appropriate examination and testing to
16 detect neuropathy, circulatory insufficiency
17 complications.

18 They wanted confirmation by an
19 ophthalmologist the absence of clinically
20 significant eye disease. That meant that they
21 had to have a -- which is one of the standards of
22 care. You have to have an annual complete
23 dilated eye exam by an ophthalmologist and it
24 gives more details about that. The fact that

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

1 having what we call background retinopathy,

2 microaneurysms, exudates or other findings of
3 background retinopathy by themselves are not
4 sufficient grounds for disqualification. It had
5 to be something that would be affecting their
6 vision. Background retinopathy does not affect
7 their vision.

8 Q. Yes, sir.

9 A. Verification by a specialist that the
10 individual has been educated in diabetes and its
11 control and been thoroughly informed and
12 understands monitoring and management, that is
13 what I mentioned before. They should be
14 receiving appropriate insulin treatment for at
15 least six months prior to submitting it. This is
16 again to make sure that people were stable, they
17 had adequate time to control their diabetes, had
18 not just been started on insulin because it takes
19 a period of time for a person to make the
20 necessary adjustments to learn all they have to
21 learn so we thought that they had to have been on
22 insulin for at least six months. So those were
23 kind of the things to pass the physical exam, if
24 you will. There must be -- the monitoring

1 protocol must be in here.

2 Q. I believe if you look at Page 11 where it
3 says Guidelines for Individuals with ITDS Who
4 Have Been Granted Special Issuance of Airman
5 Medical Certificates.

6 A. Right. This we all -- again, this is my
7 preference for using the term guidelines rather
8 than protocol. I mean, it sounds like what I
9 wrote. It's coming back to me. Medical
10 evaluation by a specialist every three months,
11 glycated hemoglobin at that time and evaluation
12 of their continued ability and willingness to
13 monitor and manage properly their diabetes. You
14 know, that is the motivation part of it. They
15 had to carry and use a digital whole blood
16 glucose measuring device with a memory. That's I
17 think an important fact because you can't fake
18 it. These things have a memory, you can't change
19 what's in there. And so when you bring it into
20 the doctor's office, you can download it and get
21 the past record and make sure that there aren't
22 wide fluctuations showing up in there that the
23 person didn't tell you about. Provide the FAA on
24 an annual basis written confirmation by a

1 specialist that the diabetes remains under
2 control without significant complications and
3 that they demonstrated reasonable accuracy and
4 recording of their blood glucose measurements
5 with the above device, which means you can
6 download it and review the record. You have to
7 have an annual eye exam. They have to report any
8 episode of hypoglycemia associated with cognitive
9 impairment, whether or not it's related in an
10 accident or adverse event. So kind of any
11 episode of hypoglycemia that would be severe
12 enough to impair your mental function, judgment.

13 Q. And that is what the concern is about, to be
14 certain that you maintain cognitive ability?

15 A. Yes. This would basically be reviewed and
16 this is all referring to these periodic checkups.
17 And, you know, you don't want somebody who -- I'm
18 trying to recall now. That maybe they had to be
19 free of severe hypoglycemic reactions for a
20 certain period of time, you know, when they were
21 first given the waiver and then there had to be
22 some kind of ongoing monitoring.

23 Q. I think this says in there if they
24 experience a hypoglycemic episode that they have

1 to show good performance for a one-year period.

2 Do you recall that?

3 A. It could be. This gets into the definition
4 of what severe hypoglycemia means. Does it mean
5 where an individual's ability to function
6 properly mentally is impaired, and if they have
7 this kind of a reaction in their history -- and
8 many people don't. Most people if they are well
9 controlled will never have a significant severe
10 hypoglycemic reaction. And we grade hypoglycemic
11 reactions according to a scale that was really
12 developed with the Diabetes Control Complications
13 Trial. So a mild reaction might be feeling a
14 little hungry or just getting a little -- you
15 know, just many people will pick up the fact
16 maybe they feel a little bit hungry, they get a
17 little queasy in their stomach, their heart may
18 go a little faster or something like that and
19 people recognize that and then they take
20 something to eat and it's gone in a couple
21 minutes, but they never get any impairment of
22 their mental function. That would be a mild

23 reaction. A more severe reaction would be one in
24 which somebody might not have normal mental

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

71

1 function and then a very severe reaction would be
2 one where you are really out of it and you need
3 help from a third person so we can grade it.

4 Q. Yes.

5 A. And this refers to cognitive impairment
6 which means some impairment your mental function.
7 That would have to be reported and reviewed and
8 we thought that we -- people have to be free of
9 that for a period.

10 Q. Right. It's worrisome even though it
11 doesn't progress to severe is what I'm
12 understanding you say?

13 A. Yes. You see, that is a safety net that you
14 have to put in any regulation like this whereas
15 most people who are managing themselves would
16 never have that. I think our feeling is that
17 again, you have to judge a person individually to
18 find out what his track record is in this area.

19 Q. I notice --

20 A. Here is the glucose management.

21 Q. This is what you were talking about earlier
22 about activity prior to and during flight and
23 prior to landing.

24 A. Yes. We set 100 to 300. I didn't remember

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

72

1 it correctly.

2 Q. You don't want that sugar to get too high?

3 A. Right. I think it was 400 in the truck
4 drivers as I recall but it was 300 in the pilots.
5 Don't ask me why. I think to the 100, we were
6 most concerned about the lower levels which is
7 the 100. Establish and document a blood glucose
8 concentration equal to or greater than 100
9 milligrams per deciliter but not greater than 300
10 milligrams within one half hour prior to takeoff.

11 Q. You are reading Page 14?

12 A. Yes. "During flight, the individual with
13 ITDM shall monitor his or her blood glucose
14 concentrations at hourly intervals and within one
15 half hour prior to landing." That was to make
16 sure that it was in a safe range before landing.
17 If a blood glucose concentration range of 100 to
18 300 is not maintained, the following action shall

19 be taken, then tell them what to do prior to
20 flight to get it up to 100 and it tells them to
21 what to do during flight and then basically it
22 says if it's below 100 it gives you directions on
23 what to seat and recheck and if it's greater than
24 100 and you can't get it down, you should land as

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

73

1 soon as practical at the nearest suitable
2 airport.
3 Q. Okay.
4 A. So this is in essence what our committee
5 recommended. I have not looked at it for several
6 years so I didn't remember all the details.
7 Q. I think the rest of the document covers the
8 rationale for the policy statement, a discussion
9 of the comments and some other matters that the
10 FAA -- I would like to ask you some questions
11 about it to the extent that you can answer them.
12 The whole purpose of considering the matter of
13 the issuing these special issuance medical
14 certificates was to alter an existent policy.
15 What is your understanding of the existing policy
16 prior to the FAA action?

17 A. That if anyone was taking insulin, they were
18 automatically disqualified from obtaining any
19 kind of a pilot's license.

20 Q. And after the announcement of this policy,
21 it's still the policy of the FAA for second-class
22 airmen and first-class airmen who have flying
23 permission or who would otherwise be able to fly
24 cannot fly because they cannot get a medical

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

74

1 certification --

2 A. I believe that's correct.

3 Q. -- if they have insulin treated diabetes
4 mellitus?

5 A. Right.

6 Q. Now, you obviously had a chance to learn a
7 little bit about what pilots do. Why is it that
8 they're divided into three different classes
9 pilots?

10 A. Well, my recollection -- again, I have not
11 looked at this for a long time, but there is -- I
12 believe class-one is a commercial pilot who flies
13 passengers in my recollection; and my
14 recollection is class-two might be a commercial

15 pilot who doesn't fly passengers but flies cargo
16 or other things like that the UPS pilots and
17 things like that; and class-three airman is a
18 private pilot who just flies himself or can take
19 passengers but not paying passengers. So that is
20 my recollection of the three grades of pilots and
21 what they do.

22 Q. You agree that piloting, like many other
23 functions in our society, because they have to be
24 licensed, piloting is a privileged duty; not

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

75

1 everybody is allowed to be a pilot?

2 A. Well, it a privileged in the sense that you
3 have to meet certain requirements to be able to
4 do that just like you have to drive a car I guess
5 would be another example.

6 Q. Right. You have to have a license or a
7 certificate from a governing authority of some
8 kind?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And pilots are divided into these three
11 classes, you would agree, on the basis of job
12 responsibility and risks assumed job? I mean,

13 job responsibility in the sense of what kind of
14 service, like you've suggested, perhaps maybe
15 it's a plane side of the type of plan that is a
16 factor, is it not?
17 A. Well, I think that the -- my thinking about
18 this would be that a private pilot is generally
19 flying a smaller airplane and it may be less
20 complicated. I don't know. But I think that the
21 real issue is the principal risk they are taking
22 is to themselves or to passengers or maybe a
23 small risk for people on the ground if they crash
24 whereas a commercial pilot who is flying a

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

76

1 passenger carrying jet obviously has people in
2 the plane that are depending on him so there is a
3 kind of this risk issue.

4 Q. It's fair to say that commercial pilots
5 undertake the higher risk than --

6 A. Yes. I can tell you the other side of the
7 risk or judgment that a commercial pilot always
8 has a co-pilot and a lot of people thought the
9 risk would be less. That was actually debated.
10 I can recall the debate about it. The commercial

11 pilot is not functioning by himself whereas as a
12 private pilot is functioning often by himself.
13 And so the question of risk really you could
14 argue both ways.
15 Q. But the risk arises more from the
16 responsibility assumed for other people --
17 A. Exactly.
18 Q. -- than anything else?
19 A. I think that was the overriding concern,
20 that it's a risk benefit ratio, if you will, or
21 risk and I think that this is always something
22 you have to weigh. The diabetes in this
23 treatment is one example, but there are many
24 other things that can incapacitate a person who

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

77

1 is carrying out a very responsible job. I mean,
2 I can be driving my car down the highway and have
3 a heart attack and lose control of my car and
4 kill myself and pedestrians.
5 Q. You agree you cannot induce a heart attack
6 though, can you, like you could a --
7 A. Well, there is a risk out there for sudden
8 things happening to people.

9 Q. I see what you're saying, but it's a lot
10 easier to induce a severe hypoglycemic episode
11 than to induce a heart attack, is it not?
12 A. I don't know. I don't know if it is. I
13 think again it gets back to an individual
14 situation. If a person is well trained, well
15 educated, motivated to take care of themselves,
16 they can do a very good job at it. In fact, they
17 are not likely to have something suddenly happen
18 that is out of their control whereas an
19 individual who is driving a car doesn't and
20 realize that his chest pains that he had the
21 night before last might be a sign of a heart
22 attack can have a heart attack and be
23 catastrophic. I don't think you can generalize
24 about that. I think somebody who is really well

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

78

1 educated, knows what they are doing, they are
2 alert to things that can happen and they can
3 appropriate steps to avoid it.

4 Q. So long as circumstances are within his
5 control?

6 A. As long as they are within his control,

7 right, but somebody who has a heart attack is,
8 quote, catastrophic or sudden illness but there
9 are warning signs there too that people ignore.
10 That is just one example. We can think of other
11 situations. Don't get me talking about alcohol.
12 Q. So very clearly, the FAA was concerned about
13 the safety and the process, as you've suggested,
14 produced medical and safety standards I think it
15 mentions in the document itself the notion of
16 consistently with aviation safety.
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. What does that mean to you?
19 A. Well, I think that safety is always an
20 issue. I think that is what we're all concerned
21 with, making the individuals healthy and safety
22 when it comes to any kind of high risk
23 occupation, safety of your own person and safety
24 of those that are around you or that you're

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

79

1 responsible for has always been an issue.
2 Q. And a higher risk activity would involve --
3 well, in the case certainly of flying would
4 involve the matter of speed. You have a plane

5 that is moving at a high rate of speed, obviously
6 you have the matter of height if you fall out of
7 air, you have the matter of dealing with the
8 environment and you have reduced room for air
9 reduced room, reduced room for loss of capacity
10 and an increased risk of safety to others?

11 A. As I was flying into Boston two nights ago
12 from Denver, the flight attendant who was saying,
13 you know, thank you for flying with us, we
14 appreciate your business said, you have now -- I
15 wish you a safe trip home. You are not now about
16 to start the most dangerous part of your journey.

17 Q. That is certainly not a circumstance where
18 you want a very large margin of error allowed, is
19 it?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Now, I think the end result of the FAA
22 consideration in the matter was that type one
23 diabetics or let me change that because you have
24 corrected me. In insulin treated diabetic

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

80

1 mellitus individuals are eligible to perform only
2 certain duties of a pilot, namely those of a

3 third-class airman and again, only if it conforms
4 with a prescribed protocol. I think it also says
5 that the prescribed special protocol, I assume
6 that means the employment protocol for these
7 limited special issuance licenses that was
8 developed by special panel of distinguished
9 endocrinologists which included yourself provides
10 for operational and functional limitations.
11 These pilots can do -- could not do certain
12 things that the second-class and first-class
13 pilots are free to do?

14 A. Right.

15 Q. Why is that again?

16 A. Well, again, I think that this was the
17 concern over balancing, making it possible for
18 somebody with insulin treated diabetes to do
19 something for which they were otherwise fully
20 qualified, namely fly a private but stop short of
21 the level of responsibility, if you will, for
22 flying a passenger plane or commercial plane.
23 And this is always a judgment call, and my sense
24 looking at this historically is that you kind of

1 take one step at a time if you move forward in
2 these things. My own personal feeling is that an
3 insulin treated diabetic person who was
4 monitoring and following protocols and maintained
5 their blood glucose could do these other levels
6 of activity just as well, but I think that our
7 society and our government and people that make
8 the rules weren't quite ready for it yet.

9 Q. And thinking behind, moving forward one step
10 at a time I assume is to gain some experience --

11 A. Of course.

12 Q. -- with respect to the risk?

13 A. The proof is in the pudding ultimately.

14 Q. Who should make the final judgment with
15 respect to the risk factors?

16 A. Well, I think -- I think it's a process that
17 is the interaction between advice from panels of
18 experts in a field such as the one that I was
19 part of and the people who make the rules and
20 regulations, the legislative or it really is a
21 societal decision, if you will, ultimately.

22 MR. MORENO: Anybody need a break?

23 VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record.

24 (Break taken).

1 (Exhibit No. 4 marked
2 for identification).

3 BY MR. MORENO:

4 Q. Doctor, you had mentioned earlier the
5 air-traffic controller program, and this
6 deposition Exhibit Number 3 discusses a
7 comparison between the two, and I notice one of
8 the things that is mentioned is that solo beauty
9 is prohibited in the case of an air-traffic
10 controller but not a private pilot. And as you
11 mentioned earlier, there is a requirement that
12 they maintain the blood glucose level that is a
13 slightly higher level than you would ordinarily
14 require of a person committed to control. Again,
15 why is it that the requirements are apparently
16 stricter for the air-traffic controller than a
17 private pilot?

18 A. Yes. Well, I think a couple of factors. I
19 think the work that was done with the air-traffic
20 controllers was actually earlier than the work
21 done with the private pilots' licenses. I think
22 that it was considered to be very sensitive
23 because these individuals had been working. Many
24 of them had been working and were removed from

1 active duty summarily, essentially without
2 looking at individual qualifications or
3 individual performance, and if fact, some of the
4 individuals had been performing very well as
5 air-traffic controllers for a long time. So
6 there was a situation where it was really trying
7 to come up with a protocol that would allow
8 reinstatement of individuals. So this was kind
9 of a reinstatement of something they'd been doing
10 before. So that had a slightly different flavor
11 to it.

12 I think the other issue was that when
13 air-traffic controllers are sitting there, they
14 are -- apparently there is no downtime. When
15 they are on duty, they have to be continually
16 alert, and they are in a situation where they are
17 being generally supervised. So I think these
18 were probably all things that were in the
19 discussion as I remember and these are kind of
20 issues that came up at that time.

21 Q. What about the fact that they're responsible
22 not for one commercial plane but for many loaded
23 with passengers?

24 A. Exactly. So all of these things entered

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

84

1 into -- let's just say that we're going to set up
2 rules and regulations that will just virtually
3 eliminate any risk -- I mean, the FAA said, we
4 cannot tolerate any risk in this job and the
5 issue came up, well, what if one of your
6 air-traffic controllers has a heart attack or has
7 something else happen to him and you point out
8 that you can never in any situation totally
9 eliminate risk.

10 Q. So you do the next best next?

11 A. Right. So there are long discussions about
12 that. Well, what do you do to minimize the risk
13 then. We were I think in our recommendations
14 were being ultra conservative. We wanted to make
15 it possible for these people to get back to work.
16 And again, I think you brought up the proof is in
17 the pudding, you want to collect data, get some
18 experience, find out how it works, you can all
19 modify the rules later on and so forth. So I
20 think that probably explains the difference that
21 you're pointing out.

22 Q. I notice on the restrictions on the
23 third-class airman, a person who receives that
24 certificate cannot be required to be a -- let me

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

85

1 restate that. He cannot be a required crew
2 member outside of the United States. I found
3 that curious. Why was that?

4 A. I have no idea. That didn't cover my
5 report.

6 Q. I guess in other words, if you sneak across
7 the border, you can't be a required crew member.
8 It seems to me required must mean you have to
9 have it to get the plane up or down.

10 A. That's news to me. I don't know what that
11 means. It seems to me that that might be a
12 carry-over from having people on commercial
13 flights or something like that, but I don't have
14 a clue.

15 Q. As you mentioned earlier, the FAA invited
16 comments on whether insulin treated diabetic
17 mellitus individuals should be restricted by
18 class of medical certificates, by class of airman
19 certificates, by operation limits. Now I want to

20 look at some of those. I know the ADA was
21 interested in making the licenses available to
22 all three classes; is that not correct?
23 A. I don't know what the official ADA position
24 was.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

86

1 Q. I don't either. Okay. Are you a member of
2 the American Association of Clinical
3 Endocrinologists?
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. Are you familiar with that organization?
6 A. Yes. AACE.
7 Q. And did they participate in your part of the
8 consideration of this issue?
9 A. Not in my part of it. They may have had
10 some opinion about it, but they had no formal
11 involvement that I'm aware of in the selection of
12 the panel. I suppose it's conceivable they might
13 have submitted names for consideration or
14 something but I'm not aware of it.
15 Q. Okay. Look at deposition Exhibit Number 3
16 on the bottom of Page 26. I think there is
17 reference to their comments or their

18 participation.

19 A. Yes. They may have commented. They
20 probably commented.

21 Q. It says, In opposition to the policy, the
22 American Association of Clinical Endocrinologists
23 (AACE), do you want to read that?

24 A. Okay. "In Opposition to the policy was the

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

87

1 American Association of Clinical Endocrinologists
2 (AACE). AACE opposed any policy change which
3 would permit ITDM individuals to be eligible for
4 medical certification. It stated the associated
5 risks of this disease cannot be eliminated and
6 that granting medical certification would pose
7 unnecessary risk to both the patient and the
8 general populace. AACE contended that the
9 physiological effects of flight and the
10 constraints of operating and aircraft decrease
11 the likelihood of proper monitoring and
12 management of blood glucose levels while in
13 flight and increases the risk of impairment or
14 incapacitation of ITDM individuals."

15 Q. Okay. Well, so there is some disagreement

16 even among endocrinologists as to the
17 appropriateness?

18 A. Well, I --

19 Q. Giving them licenses?

20 A. I don't know who was involved in that
21 opposition, but this is obviously controversial
22 of course.

23 Q. A little bit further down I think the -- is
24 it the Endocrine Society?

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

88

1 A. I am I member of the Endocrine Society too.

2 Q. Did I pronounce that correctly?

3 A. Yes. I think it was the next paragraph. I
4 think they also they also came out against this
5 as well.

6 Q. They, "Also opposed any change of FAA policy
7 regarding ITDM individuals. The society stated
8 that if a special issuance of a medical
9 certificate is to be granted, an ITDM individual
10 who has had even one severe hypoglycemic within
11 the last three years should not be eligible for
12 issuance of a medical certificate." It also
13 says, "It further contends -- this is what I

14 wanted to ask you about. "It further contended
15 that food ingestion should never be permitted in
16 lieu of hourly in flight glucose testing and that
17 an ITDM individual should have another qualified
18 pilot in the cockpit at all times and that an
19 ITDM individual should not be allowed to pilot
20 commercial aircraft." They point, "The society
21 pointed to the results of a recent study on the
22 treatment of individuals with ITDM which shows
23 that proper treatment of patients with ITDM
24 requires tighter control of blood glucose levels

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

89

1 and leads to an unavoidably higher risk of a
2 hypoglycemic reaction. According to the society,
3 tight control of the blood glucose level of an
4 ITDM individual produces significantly better
5 long term outcome through the reduction of the
6 occurrence of nephropathy, retinopathy, and
7 neuropathy. Therefore, the society stated,
8 appropriate treatment of ITDM individuals would
9 unavoidably lead to a higher risk of hypoglycemic
10 reaction, which should preclude these patients
11 from obtaining special issuance of a medical

12 certificate." It's the last part.
13 A. Let me give you my opinion. This was in
14 '95, '96. The Diabetes Control and Complications
15 Trial results were published in '93. This was a
16 landmark study that really showed beyond any
17 question of a doubt that average blood sugar as
18 close to normal markedly reduces the development
19 of these long term complications so retinopathy,
20 neuropathy, nephropathy, what is called
21 microvascular complications of diabetes. And
22 it's true that on average in that study that the
23 attempts to get the blood glucose to as close to
24 normal as possible so people were taking multiple

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

90

1 shots a day, they were told keep trying, keep
2 trying, keep trying was associated with an
3 increased risk of hypoglycemic events in the
4 study as a whole. But what was not recognized at
5 that time was that when you analyze that the
6 increased risk of hypoglycemia was not across the
7 board. It was in a subset of individuals who
8 tended to get hypoglycemic reactions, but there
9 are many people who achieved the targets who had

10 no hypoglycemic reaction. So again, it gets back
11 to the individual situation. I think what the
12 Endocrine Society was concerned about is we don't
13 want people to go around in letting their blood
14 sugars run too high and be at increased risk of
15 long term complications just so they can fly an
16 airplane. I think it was this balancing act.

17 Again, I don't know who specifically at the
18 -- Endocrine Society, I don't recall who actually
19 made these comments, but I'm -- from the
20 comments, I'm sure it was what the concern was,
21 that if you push and push and push, the DCCT
22 results did show increased risk of hypoglycemic
23 reactions in the group with intensive control,
24 and they didn't want people backing off and

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

91

1 getting more complications.

2 I think as we learn more about this -- we've
3 learned a lot from the diabetes control and
4 complications trials. We've learned that you
5 really adjust the degree of control based on an
6 individual basis. Some individuals can get their
7 hemoglobin A1C down to normal and never have a

8 hypoglycemic reaction. Other people can be
9 relatively poorly controlled and they have lots
10 of hypoglycemic reactions. So this gets back to
11 the whole issue again of individual -- you have
12 to look at each individual separately.

13 Q. Well, one of the commentators or comments I
14 think is the terminology says implementation of
15 the proposed guidelines relies too heavily on the
16 applicant's objectivity and honesty in assessing
17 his or her medical condition. That was the
18 objection to the --

19 A. The honor system.

20 Q. Yes. The employer or the public in all
21 cases has to assume the risk of the honor system
22 to the extent that is it's not fully --

23 A. I'll give you my opinion about that too. I
24 think this is part of your working with an

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

92

1 individual with diabetes. You know pretty much
2 when you're working with somebody, especially
3 when you can download their meter and see if they
4 are being honest with you or not or just if what
5 they say their control is or if it matches their

6 hemoglobin A1C or it doesn't, you have a pretty
7 good working knowledge of whether somebody is
8 managing their diabetes well or not. I think
9 that is part of the evaluation that I would
10 certainly do in considering somebody whether
11 they're really medically qualified to perform at
12 high risk occupation. Again, you can't make a
13 rule that fits everybody.

14 Q. The report also says and I'm not -- it's in
15 there I know. It says the ADA requested the
16 creation of an FAA appointed medical task force
17 to develop a medical protocol to permit case by
18 case review of applicants for airman medical
19 certificates of any class. Do you recall that
20 request being made?

21 A. It was not -- this was all stuff that came
22 out in probably either comments or around this
23 time. I don't recall exactly when that was made.
24 It doesn't surprise me that the ADA really wanted

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

1 to set up a medical task force to look at this
2 because it's clearly -- it's clearly the message
3 that somebody who has diabetes, takes insulin,

4 responsible, well controlled, well educated can
5 do anything for which they're otherwise
6 qualified.

7 Q. To your knowledge, was a medical task force
8 of that type ever created?

9 A. Well, no. I presume it doesn't refer to the
10 committee that I served on.

11 Q. That's right. This is for all classes of
12 airmen.

13 A. I don't know whether that one was ever
14 formed or not.

15 Q. Did the ADA have such a committee?

16 A. Not that I'm aware of.

17 Q. Certainly it's feasible for the ADA to
18 create such a committee?

19 A. They could. I actually don't know whether
20 one was created or not subsequent to that. I
21 have not heard that one was but I don't know.
22 I'm sure we could find out.

23 Q. One of the things I discussed briefly with
24 Dr. DeFranco was the idea of a type one diabetic

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

1 participating in combat. The Vietnam War comes

2 to mind. Is that something that you think a
3 person who is highly motivated could participate
4 in or would he be facing unacceptable risks?
5 A. Well, I don't know. I don't know what the
6 military rules are specifically regarding insulin
7 treated diabetes and combat duty. I know that
8 there are many people who have gone through wars
9 with their diabetes and survived and done well,
10 but I don't know what the military policies are.
11 I know one person who made their own insulin all
12 through World War II when they were in Shanghai
13 when the Japanese overran the city, and she was
14 an insulin treated diabetic. Her husband was an
15 engineer there and the insulin got all used up.
16 There was no insulin available. He somehow got
17 access to a book in the library of how you
18 isolate insulin, went to the local abattoir, got
19 pancreases, made a crude extract of insulin and
20 not only treated his wife throughout the entire
21 Japanese occupation but treated like 100 children
22 with type one diabetes through two or three years
23 of Japanese occupation in Shanghai. This was a
24 remarkable woman who described the insulin she

1 took as kind of looking of looked Coca-Cola. It
2 was not very pure insulin. So people get pretty
3 creative in this business.

4 Q. I had a discussion with Dr. DeFranco about
5 the absence of tests for predicting whether a
6 person experiencing a hypoglycemic occurrence,
7 and I came away with the feeling that the best
8 available approach for prediction right now
9 whether a person will develop a hypoglycemic
10 reaction is really what you do clinically by
11 accumulating information about the patient,
12 clinically treating him, clinically reviewing his
13 blood glucose values and clinically attempting to
14 bring about the best possible control while
15 avoiding hypoglycemia by making adjustments to
16 the insulin prescribed and how it's administered.
17 Do you agree with that?

18 A. Yes, fundamentally. The best predictor is
19 probably experience, the track record of an
20 individual. I mean, if they have been able to go
21 for a year or two or three years or five years or
22 whatever without hypoglycemic reactions, then I
23 think the likelihood of them having one in the
24 next week or two is pretty low. If somebody has

1 a history of having a lot of hypoglycemic
2 reactions, chances are better. So I think just
3 looking at track records is really an important
4 thing to do and the way to avoid it is what we
5 have discussed. It really is training and
6 self-management and being smart about what you
7 are doing.

8 Q. A test that would predict whether you would
9 or would not have a hypoglycemic episode is kind
10 of like prevention, it's desirable but it's not
11 there yet?

12 A. Can you predict if you're going have to
13 something else happen to you? You can never
14 predict the future 100 percent, but I think that
15 you have a pretty good idea what is happening.
16 And a person who monitors his blood glucose, who
17 knows what a unit of insulin or two units of
18 insulin will do to his blood glucose, knows what
19 a certain amount of food or type of food does to
20 his glucose, knows what exercise does to his
21 glucose, he has a good knowledge base.

22 Q. There are tests in medicine though that
23 allow to you do some predictions?

24 A. Well, blood glucose is continually

1 fluctuation in a pretty narrow range. We do know
2 if you have too much insulin on board, the blood
3 sugar will drop. You know the physiology.

4 Q. I'm not referring to blood glucose. Just
5 generally in medicine you physicians rely on
6 certain tests to predict certain outcomes, do
7 they not? I mean, medicine is not free -- free
8 is not the right word. But medicine doesn't
9 operate without such tests?

10 A. Right. Trying to predict what is going to
11 happen with a patient with a certain disease, is
12 that what you're referring to?

13 Q. Yes.

14 A. Depends on the knowledge that you have about
15 that person and the disease.

16 Q. Right. But there are some tests that
17 actually assist the physician in predicting
18 outcomes?

19 A. Give me an example.

20 Q. Well, I would rather you give me one.

21 A. I'm trying to think of one I mean that would
22 fit with what you are driving at because I'm not

23 really sure what you are driving at. I'm having
24 a hard a time. If someone has a cancer, can you

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

98

1 predict how long they are going to live? Well,
2 sure, you can give averages based on statistics
3 from experience with a lot of people. But there
4 are plenty of people that as an individual, it's
5 very difficult to predict what is going to
6 happen. I would say that you're trying to use
7 your knowledge, your judgment, your experience to
8 make your best guess about what is going to
9 happen, but I don't know anybody that has a
10 crystal ball that's going to tell you what's
11 going to happen.

12 Q. I don't think anybody is holding you to a
13 crystal ball standard. Well, back to the
14 frustration of the researchers, you would agree
15 that the goal of the technology is to mimic in a
16 sense, to develop a device or a method or means
17 that automatically that things like automatically
18 detects, automatically detects the blood glucose
19 level, automatically signal the appropriate
20 source of the need to make insulin, automatically

21 make insulin appropriate to respond to the blood
22 glucose levels detected or measured
23 automatically, infuse the insulin and
24 automatically stop making the insulin as the

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

99

1 blood glucose level is detected to be started to
2 fall. I mean, isn't that the missing piece?
3 A. Well, first of all, I wouldn't say it's
4 frustration. I would rather use the term
5 challenge. I don't feel frustrated. I'm very
6 excited actually about the progress we're making
7 and the things we are doing and I think that
8 watching -- I've been working in this field for
9 over 30 years. You have to kind of pinch
10 yourself once in a while to remember what it was
11 like 10 years ago or 20 years ago or 30 years
12 ago. We've made incredible strides. I feel
13 really positive about -- I think the future for
14 people with diabetes in year 2000 is totally
15 different than it was in 10 years ago or 15 years
16 ago and particularly in our ability to achieve
17 good control and avoid these long term
18 complications. You know, ten years ago if I took

19 you to the eye institute on the first floor here,
20 you would see a lot of people with seeing eye
21 dogs. I haven't seen a seeing eye dog in this
22 building in a year. We can now with annual exams
23 by somebody who knows what they're looking at,
24 with early detection, laser therapy prevent 95

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

100

1 percent of the visual loss.

2 We know we have made huge strides in
3 reducing the kidney disease. It's true that
4 diabetic renal disease is still the most common
5 reason for a person to go into a kidney dialysis
6 program or a kidney transplant program, but those
7 numbers are falling dramatically. So I actually
8 when I look over the years, we've made tremendous
9 strides. Now, sure the wholly grail is to be
10 able to prevent or cure the disease altogether,
11 and we will all be extremely happy. We are not
12 there yet.

13 Q. When you do that, you will restore or bring
14 about automatic regulations?

15 A. What we are trying to do is to come as close
16 to restoring the normal physiology as we can.

17 Excuse me.

18 (Break taken).

19 BY MR. MORENO:

20 Q. I just would like to read you some
21 propositions here and see if you agree with them.
22 Well controlled conditions exist when the
23 scheduling of meals and diet and the amount of
24 physical exertion are regular and preplanned and

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

101

1 the amounts and timing of insulin injections can
2 be predetermined.

3 A. I disagree with that completely. I think
4 that that is maybe the thinking of 20 years ago,
5 and now the thinking is to train people in
6 self-management to make their life as flexible
7 and variable and normal as they can so they can
8 do whatever they their jobs require or they want
9 to do in their recreation. I think that we now
10 have the tools to free people from this sort of
11 rigid type regulated life to give them true
12 flexibility, and we've made tremendous strides in
13 that area. So what I do when I'm working with my
14 patients is train them to do the things we have

15 been talking about to allow them the flexibility.
16 I work with a lot of college kids who pull
17 all-nighters, who decide at midnight to go out
18 for a pizza, and people with diabetes have to be
19 able to do that and they can. So flexibility is
20 the word, not rigidity.

21 Q. How about this one, utilized in intensive
22 therapy, there would be a substantial risk of a
23 severe hypoglycemic occurrence if a subject type
24 one diabetic took an injection of insulin

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

102

1 immediately before eating a meal and if the meal
2 and or some form of carbohydrate or glucose
3 became unavailable or was missed because of job
4 or other constraints?

5 A. Well, we have a way around that one too, and
6 I think that this was talked about this before
7 too. The rapidly acting insulin that we use,
8 Humalog, which you can carry with you at all
9 times in a pen so you can take it. You don't
10 take it until the food is in front of you. I
11 actually have some people who actually take it
12 right in the middle of the meal so it avoids that

13 -- you can avoid that situation. You don't take
14 your insulin until you are ready to take your
15 food or if you're in a situation where the food
16 may be snatched away from you, you can eat first,
17 then take your insulin.

18 Q. Right. But if you have taken your insulin
19 in anticipation of being able to ingest the food,
20 then an emergency occurs, you have a problem?

21 A. Suppose I gave you an injection of insulin,
22 you don't have diabetes, okay, and just gave you
23 an injection of insulin and said, I'm not going
24 to give you any food to cover it, you would

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

103

1 develop hypoglycemia too.

2 Q. That's right. If I were a police officer
3 and I had to go save somebody's life and it was
4 either my life or his life, I would have a
5 problem with that.

6 A. No, I don't think so. First of all, you can
7 always do the situation where have got the food
8 in one hand and you take your insulin to cover
9 it. If you have food with you, so suppose you
10 started your meal and you've taken your insulin

11 and now the alarm goes off and you have to get up
12 and run, you can always have a candy bar with
13 you, you can have something to drink. I don't
14 really see that as a problem.

15 Q. But you would have to pay some attention to
16 that on your way out the door, would you not?

17 A. Of course would you. I don't I have many of
18 my patients that wouldn't pay attention to that
19 I guess is what I'm trying to say.

20 MR. MORENO: Doctor, you are very
21 kind to answer my questions. I will turn you
22 over to Mr. Griffin.

23 EXAMINATION BY MR. GRIFFIN:

24 Q. Give us your full name, Doctor.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

104

1 A. Edward Shore Horton.

2 Q. And what do you do for a living today?

3 A. Well, I'm a professor of medicine at Harvard
4 Medical School and I'm vice president and
5 director of clinical research here at the Joslin
6 Diabetes Center. What that translate into is
7 have the kind of traditional academic career. I
8 see patients and manage people with diabetes and

9 related conditions, I carry out research and
10 mostly clinical research and do I teaching.

11 Q. All right. Is Exhibit Number 4 a copy of
12 what we non-doctors call a resume but in medicine
13 is CV or curriculum vitae of yours?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And all those dozens of articles reflect
16 under the research that you have done in the area
17 of diabetes?

18 A. Yes, that's correct.

19 Q. How many years of your career has been
20 devoted to the both treating patients and
21 researching diabetes?

22 A. Well, I completed by specialty training in
23 endocrinology and diabetes in 1967 and so I was
24 working in the diabetes field from 1964 to 1967

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

105

1 specifically, and then I've been working full
2 time in endocrinology and metabolism, internal
3 medicine since 1967.

4 Q. All right. I want to talk to you about four
5 or five developments that you talked about with
6 Mr. Moreno. I'm just going to hand you -- it's

7 not an exhibit, but let me hand you what I
8 believe to be an insulin pen.

9 A. Right.

10 Q. Now, does that pen reflect two of the most
11 recent technological advances in the treatment of
12 type one or I should say insulin treated
13 diabetes?

14 A. Well, I think the thing that is the newest
15 is the type of insulin that's in this pen,
16 humalog insulin, which was developed by Eli
17 Lilly, also called lyspro insulin which is a
18 modification of insulin that makes it absorb very
19 rapidly and a shorter duration of action than
20 regular insulin. So this is the type of insulin
21 that we currently have many of our patients using
22 just prior to meals or just at the time they are
23 ready to eat a meal to provide the insulin they
24 need for covering that meal. It's also the type

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

106

1 of insulin that most of our patients are using in
2 an insulin pump now.

3 Q. Before 1996, was there even such a thing as
4 insulin that would be absorbed rapidly within a

5 matter of an hour or two and its left-over
6 effects dissipating shortly thereafter? Did we
7 have such and insulin?

8 A. No. This is the first insulin that has that
9 characteristic. The regular insulin, which has
10 been available for a much longer period of time,
11 is more slowly absorbed and lasts somewhat longer
12 and this is the first of these so-called modified
13 rapidly acting insulins to be available.

14 Q. I want to show you what I carry around with
15 me, but maybe you could show it to the camera and
16 ask if that depicts actually the method of action
17 or the length of time that insulin actually
18 operates within the body?

19 A. Yes. This is a graph which does kind of
20 show the absorption and time course of three
21 different types of insulin. The one on the top
22 is this Humalog or lispro which is absorbed very
23 rapidly and is then is gone in just a few hours.
24 The middle one I believe is regular insulin which

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

107

1 shows a slightly slowly absorption and longer
2 duration of action. And the bottom one is NPH

3 which is what we call an intermediate insulin
4 which is more slowly absorbed and lasts usually
5 14 to 16, 18 hours, not quite 24 hours and we use
6 that for what we call basal insulin treatment.
7 These are three insulins. There are other ones
8 that are available as well.

9 Q. Sure. What was -- when the history shows
10 that this significant development of the
11 development of the Humalog or the lispro insulin,
12 what does this mean when it says that it's the
13 first human analog insulin?

14 A. What it means is they have taken two amino
15 acids in the molecule and changed them.
16 Actually, they've changed the lysine and prolin
17 and that is why it's called lyspro insulin. What
18 this shift in the two amino acids in the insulin
19 molecule have done is it's changed the
20 aggregation characteristics of the molecule so
21 that instead of forming hexamers, it does not
22 form hexers. It really forms dimers and they are
23 rapidly disassociated. So this is how they have
24 achieved the very rapid absorption

1 characteristics of the insulin. So when they
2 say it's a modified human insulin, it's in all
3 other regards, it has the same biological
4 activities as human insulin. It just by changing
5 the position, they change the shape of the
6 molecule so that it's absorbed more rapidly.

7 Q. Now, the actual pen itself you are looking
8 at, the delivery system, is that something that
9 became available for the general public around
10 1998, 1999?

11 A. In the US.

12 Q. Yes.

13 A. Yes, that is right. In the US we've tended
14 to use needles and syringes as our standard way
15 of giving insulin. Pumps have been around for a
16 while. The pen system, the Novo Nordisk Company
17 had a pen for many years. Pens have been
18 available in Europe and used quite extensively in
19 Europe, but they were really introduced by Eli
20 Lilly Company in the US just within the last
21 couple of years.

22 Q. Did they --

23 A. -- have also had pens available for a while,
24 but they are really catching on and because of

1 their convenience.

2 Q. Did they avoid the necessity of the patient
3 actually getting the vile of insulin out of the
4 refrigerator, then carefully drawing it up in the
5 syringe and can you avoid that by using the dial
6 on the pen for a precise dose?

7 A. Yes. The way that this works is that you
8 put a needle on it, it's like little syringe and
9 you just dial in your dose and then you can just
10 inject it. So you're carrying it around with you
11 all the time. You don't have to take the time to
12 draw it up. It's convenient, it's quick, it's
13 easy.

14 Q. Now, let me ask you this, ten years ago,
15 were you able to have patients to have monitors
16 that would maintain memories and uploadable
17 computer data to download to the doctors as a
18 regular treating mechanism?

19 A. Well, probably ten years ago is when the
20 first ones starting coming. We went through the
21 whole evolution of doing -- of putting a drop of
22 blood on a strip and just being able to then
23 rinse it off and hold it up and match the color
24 with a scale and then they developed meters,

1 reflective meters which would actually read it,
2 then they improved the technology so that they
3 developed memories so you could download them.
4 This has been an evolution of meters. Meters
5 have gotten even smaller, more convenient to use,
6 less mess, faster and now there are just a very
7 convenient thing to use.

8 Q. Let me ask you if this is an example of the
9 kinds of meters that are available at any
10 Walgreen's Drug Store today?

11 A. Yes. Well, this is an Exact Tech which was
12 made by Medisense which was located here in
13 Boston so you picked a Boston meter. Yes, this
14 is an example. It's about the size of a credit
15 card, fits in your pocket and you can check your
16 blood sugar in just a matter of seconds with this
17 any time you want.

18 Q. Have all of these devices that we've talked
19 about and what you've discussed with Mr. Moreno
20 given the individual who has insulin treated
21 diabetes the methods that allow them to control
22 their blood sugar?

23 A. Well, these are all tools basically people

24 can use to -- the blood glucose monitoring system

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

111

1 is to get information, to find out what your
2 blood sugar is at that particular point in time,
3 use that information and make a judgment about
4 eating some food or exercising or taking an
5 insulin dose.

6 This pen system is an example of a
7 convenient way to take a rapidly acting insulin
8 and so people have many more tools now to manage
9 their own diabetes.

10 Of course key to this is training program,
11 training in self-management, learning the
12 physiology that they need to know to make these
13 judgements and then the day-to-day experience
14 that you get by actually doing it.

15 Q. Have these changes in medical technology in
16 your opinion resulted in the changing world of
17 commercial truck drivers, pilots, air-traffic
18 controllers and scuba drivers all in the past
19 decade?

20 A. Yes. I think that people now have much more
21 control over their diabetes management and much

22 more flexibility in their day-to-day life and
23 much more freedom. So that by checking blood
24 sugars, by adjusting insulin and the different

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

112

1 types of insulin by food intake. All of these
2 things people can lead much more flexible lives
3 than they could before we had these tools
4 available, and they can maintain their blood
5 glucose levels in a near normal range or close to
6 normal range while avoiding wide swings blood
7 glucose from either too high or too low.

8 Q. So if I hear what you're saying by
9 sacrificing, that the patient is sacrificing
10 their time and taking care of themselves and
11 responsibility in blood monitoring and keeping
12 their blood monitoring up to date and also using
13 their judgment about their insulin, they are able
14 it keep their blood sugars in a normal or near
15 normal level?

16 A. Yes. I mean, it takes a lot of work. It
17 does take a lot of work. You have to --
18 currently the best way to know what your blood
19 sugar is is to prick your finger and get a drop

20 of blood which hurts a little bit to do it. And
21 you have to take that, you have to have the
22 knowledge and the training to know what to do
23 with the information. You have to figure out how
24 much insulin to take, what to eat, how to balance

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

113

1 the two. You have to know what exercise is going
2 to do. So you have to be savvy and well trained
3 to do this so it does take a lot of work, but
4 many of our patients get very, very good at it,
5 and they do whatever they need to do for either
6 their occupation or their recreation.

7 Q. Well, let's talk about -- just for a moment
8 why don't I ask you about some hypotheticals of
9 what would happen if somebody put a gun to
10 somebody's head after they'd taken insulin but
11 before they were able to eat their food. Can
12 anyone that who is at risk of being kidnapped
13 before they can eat, are they are able to avoid
14 that merely by giving their fast acting insulin
15 after they've finished eating?

16 A. Well, they can do that. If they thought
17 that they were in a situation where something

18 like this might happen, you know, they can
19 certainly take their insulin after they ate. I
20 think if they are -- if you wanted to make an
21 error, you know, you're put in a situation where
22 you can't control things, it's out of your
23 control, you want to have your blood sugar on the
24 high side rather than the low side so what you

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

114

1 would do is either take extra food if you could
2 or withhold insulin or delay insulin or something
3 like that.

4 Q. So let me ask you this, in your experience
5 in your 30 years of treating patients, have you
6 ever had a patient complain that they were
7 forcibly taken from their meal while they were at
8 the table?

9 A. No. I think the most common situation I've
10 seen is when somebody goes to a restaurant and
11 they take their insulin -- this is the days
12 before the rapid acting when you had to take
13 regular insulin 30 to 45 minutes before. They've
14 taken their insulin and their food didn't show
15 up.

16 Q. Right. Sure.

17 A. That can be a problem, but where somebody
18 has been forcibly -- I mean, they have taken
19 insulin and somebody has prevented them from
20 eating, I have never come across that.

21 Q. But even if a police officer has -- well,
22 first of all, can a police officer or anyone else
23 who is at risk of being kidnapped or called out
24 to duty after a shot of insulin but before they

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

115

1 eat, can they carry a pack of Life Savers in
2 their pocket and avoid even the potential of
3 hypoglycemia --

4 A. Well --

5 Q. -- by covering the insulin with the Life
6 Saver?

7 A. I tell everybody who is -- to carry food
8 with them, particularly -- let me give you an
9 another example that may be more real life than
10 the one you described -- although what you
11 described is potential -- and that is the athlete
12 who goes out for a long training run or something
13 like that. I always have them carry some sugar

14 tablets or Life Saves or some sort of rapid
15 source of calories and sugar with them. So I
16 think anybody who is working in a situation where
17 the unexpected is going to happen should have
18 food with them. I think that is part of the
19 protocol.

20 Q. So in other words, as a sacrifice as small
21 as carrying a pack of Life Savers is enough to
22 satisfy that potential?

23 A. Generally I would say that is true.

24 Q. Okay. Now, when a dedicated person who has

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

116

1 followed the physician's advice and maintains a
2 educated prospective with the disease, is that
3 person using their vigilance to regulate their
4 blood sugars?

5 A. I'm sorry. They're using their --

6 Q. They are using their vigilance and their
7 dedication to regulate their blood sugars in the
8 absence of a totally functioning pancreas?

9 A. Yes. They are making decisions. They have
10 to make decisions based on a lot of things we've
11 talked about. Based on what their blood glucose

12 is, what they are going to eat, what their
13 exercise pattern is going to be so some people
14 say they're thinking for their pancreas.
15 Q. Sure. In diabetes patients, is there a wide
16 variety in the dedication and their ability to
17 control their blood sugars in the whole pool of
18 millions of diabetics we have in our country?
19 A. Of course. I mean, there is a lot
20 individuals variation in terms of both training
21 and knowledge and motivation. Sure, of course
22 there is a lot of variety in that situation.
23 Q. And some patients who are unable to maintain
24 a safe levels of sugar or glucose in their

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

117

1 bloodstream perhaps might not be candidates for
2 some jobs whereas others who are well controlled
3 are suitable?
4 A. I certainly agree with that. It really
5 depends on the individual. You have to assess
6 each person as they come along as to whether they
7 are trained adequately, motivated adequately,
8 capable of managing their blood glucose
9 adequately for whatever occupation or recreation

10 for that matter that they're going to do. So
11 there is a lot of individual variation.

12 Q. Doctor, can you give us your opinion as to
13 whether there is any justification whatsoever for
14 any kind of a blanket exclusion or a one size
15 fits all approach to the employment of diabetics
16 in driving positions or law enforcement
17 positions?

18 A. Well, in my opinion and I feel very strongly
19 about this, that one really has to really assess
20 each individual person on their own merits, that
21 you cannot make a blanket rule to cover the whole
22 group of people with diabetes. That would just
23 be blatantly unfair because there are many people
24 who can manage their blood glucose very

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

118

1 successfully and can do anything they want to do,
2 be a professional athlete, be a scuba diver, be a
3 sky diving, be a marathon runner, do whatever
4 profession they want to do. So there clearly are
5 individuals that are trained, dedicated, capable
6 of doing that, and there are others that I would
7 never recommend that they do those things because

8 of their lack of knowledge or lack of motivation
9 or just not being able to manage their glucose
10 adequately.

11 Q. And are you comfortable, Doctor, with
12 capable endocrinologists and diabetologists
13 evaluating patients to help make these kinds of
14 determinations?

15 A. I think that it takes -- in terms of
16 management, it takes a team approach, but in
17 terms of evaluating somebody to find out how well
18 they are doing in this regard and what their
19 capabilities are, I certainly think you need to
20 have somebody who is trained in endocrinology,
21 metabolism and who works with diabetes as a
22 specialist.

23 Q. And regardless of the occupation, is the
24 most important consideration the patient's own

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

119

1 responsibility and compliance with a treatment
2 with his or her own treatment plan which keeps
3 their blood sugars in a safe and normal range?

4 A. Well, I certainly agree that the patient has
5 the major responsibility for managing their

6 diabetes, and the role of the health care team is
7 really educating people and training them and
8 giving them tools, but the ultimate
9 responsibility is with the individual. They are
10 the ones that are making decisions on a
11 day-to-day basis about how to manage their
12 diabetes.

13 Q. Let me conclude by asking you this question,
14 if a judge was looking to have someone to address
15 the area of diabetes care and the evolution and
16 the improvements that have been made, say, in the
17 nineties, what kind of qualifications and
18 credentials should the judge be looking for?

19 A. Well, certainly if you want to put an
20 individual --

21 MR. MORENO: Excuse me, Doctor. I
22 will let him answer that. I just want the record
23 to reflect that he can't speak for a judge. He
24 is not qualified.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

120

1 BY MR. GRIFFIN:

2 Q. What is important in your opinion, Doctor,
3 in looking for a person who has the right kind of

4 qualifications to talk about the evolution and
5 improvements in diabetes care during the
6 nineties?

7 A. Well, I think somebody who specializes in
8 the field. I think from clinical care point of
9 view, you certainly want endocrinologists,
10 diabetologists who specializes in that area. I
11 think if you're interested in finding the latest
12 research and things that are going on, you
13 probably want somebody who is in an academic
14 institution who is either involved in research
15 themselves and knows the field of research. So I
16 would -- I think in any situation if you are
17 trying to put together a so-called expert or
18 group of experts to advise in this area, they
19 should be highly trained and active specialists
20 in the field.

21 Q. When you say highly trained, what do you
22 mean by that?

23 A. Well, to become an endocrinologist,
24 certified endocrinologist in metabolism in the

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

1 adult medicine -- I will talk about adults and

2 pediatrics if you want, but in adult medicine,
3 the training -- you have to first of all be
4 trained in general internal medicine and you have
5 to take and pass the specialty board from the
6 American Board of Internal Medicine, then you
7 have to take additional training which we call a
8 fellowship in endocrinology and metabolism and
9 that's a minimum of two years of training. And
10 then to become certified as a specialist in
11 endocrinology and metabolism, you have to then
12 take a subspecialty examination in endocrinology
13 and metabolism to become board certified. So
14 it's a two-step process. You have to be internal
15 medicine first which is a three-year training
16 program, then you have to do at least two years
17 of endocrinology metabolism fellowship and there
18 are two different exams, then you are certified
19 as a specialist in that area.

20 Once you're certified, people can specialize
21 in different areas of endocrinology metabolism,
22 but many people work mostly in diabetes and
23 diabetes related diseases for example. So it's
24 the experience that you gain after your normal

1 training.

2 Q. You mention research. What kind of research
3 would we be looking for in addressing diabetes
4 care over the past ten years?

5 A. Well, I think since we're talking about
6 clinical care, we're talking about the
7 translation from basic research into practical
8 clinical areas. So I think that you would really
9 want to focus on the translation of basic
10 knowledge into clinical care and this would
11 generally fall into clinical -- investigation or
12 clinical research. Now, the foundation of that
13 is also basic research so you may want to really
14 know the fundamental research going on that now
15 allows the technological advances that get
16 translated into care. So you may want to look at
17 the whole spectrum, but I think the most
18 immediate problem is if you're trying to
19 understand the real advances at the care level,
20 you would probably be involved in what we call
21 clinical research.

22 Q. Okay. Now, in terms of publication and that
23 sort of thing, what kind of articles would you be
24 wanting to look at in terms of determining

1 whether or not a person is qualified in the area
2 of talking about advances in the medical care of
3 diabetes?

4 A. I think you would be specifically -- again,
5 getting down to a practical level of care, you'd
6 be interested in new insulins that are being
7 developed, new insulin delivery systems that are
8 being developed, better monitoring systems, the
9 sorts of things that provide the tools for
10 day-to-day management. You would also be
11 interested in advances going into eyelet cell
12 transplantation, pancreas transplantation, other
13 types of things that can help people with
14 diabetes. But what you're still -- eyelet cell
15 transplantation, for example, is still considered
16 experimental so there are things that are in
17 various stages of development coming down the
18 pike. But I think that the newer the
19 developments and new types of insulin, newer and
20 better insulin delivery systems and newer and
21 better glucose monitoring systems are three
22 critical elements that we need to know.

23 Q. Let me ask you ask you about some articles
24 and tell me if any of these have to do with

1 diabetes that you can tell. "Variations in
2 Response of CAT Esophageal Muscle to Stimulation
3 with Drugs," does that sound like anything that
4 has to do with diabetes?

5 A. Say this one again.

6 Q. "Regional Variations in Response to CAT
7 Esophageal Muscle to Stimulation with Drugs."

8 A. Well, I would I think that is probably
9 looking at motility of the esophagal muscle and
10 response to different drugs. I don't know
11 whether it's related to problems of autonomic
12 neuropathy, gastrointestinal diabetes or it could
13 be just a basic article looking at drug effects
14 on smooth muscle contraction.

15 Q. Another title "Effective Various Cell Free
16 Organ Extracts on Hematopoietic Stem Cells."

17 A. Well, that would be in the general field of
18 hematology. Looking at factors would probably
19 cause a differentiation and growth of --
20 hematopoietic refers to the blood cells and blood
21 system.

22 Q. "Isolation and Characterization of Aldose

23 Reductase from Calf Brain."

24 A. Well, aldose reductase is an enzyme that

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

125

1 regulates sorbitol metabolism. One of the
2 problems in diabetic neuropathy may be related to
3 accumulation to sorbitol in nerves and so there
4 is a great interest in aldose reductase
5 inhibitors in the treatment of diabetic and
6 prevention of diabetic neuropathy. So that
7 article could have some relationship to new
8 approaches to prevention or treatment of diabetic
9 neuropathy.

10 Q. And it says here, "The insulin receptor is
11 an age dependent integral component of the human
12 erythrocyte membrane." Is that talking about
13 insulin receptors or cells in type two?

14 A. Well, they are talking about insulin
15 receptor in the red cell membrane, and red cells
16 are one of the tissues in the body that do not
17 respond to insulin. Glucose moves across the red
18 cell membrane not in response to insulin. So
19 that article would have to do with some residual
20 proteins that look like insulin receptors in the

21 red cell which is not an insulin responsive
22 tissue. So that it's a very basic research type
23 of article.
24 Q. And finally moving more recently "The Effect

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

126

1 of Endurance Training on Serum Triiodothyronine
2 Kinetics in Man Physical Conditioning Marked by
3 Enhanced Thyroid Hormone Metabolism."
4 A. That is an article about thyroid hormone
5 metabolism. Triiodothyronine or T3 for short is
6 one of the two active forms of thyroid hormone.
7 We have T4, which is thyroxin, and T3 are the two
8 active forms, and actually there is a conversion
9 of T4 to T3. And this is an article looking at
10 the effects of physical training on the kinetics
11 of thyroid hormones metabolism. So that's not
12 really specifically to diabetes but to thyroid
13 hormones metabolism.
14 Q. And last of all, what journals would we be
15 wanting to look at in terms of the leading
16 journals published in the area of diabetes?
17 A. Well, the two leading US journals are
18 Diabetes and another one called Diabetes Care.

19 Diabetes focuses more on basic research, although
20 there is clinical research published there.
21 Actually, I'm an associated editor of that
22 journal. Our editorial offices are right here in
23 this building on the third floor right next to my
24 office. I closely work with that journal.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

127

1 Diabetes Care is also an official publication of
2 the American Diabetes Association and it focuses
3 more on clinical treatments, new drugs, new
4 treatments, so forth, and the editor of that
5 journal is Dr. Charles Clark at Indiana
6 University and in Indianapolis currently. And so
7 those are the two leading US journals.

8 The major European journal is a called
9 Diabetes Logia, and that's the official journal
10 of European Association Study of Diabetes and
11 then there are a variety of others. But if I had
12 to pick three journals that would have the most
13 up-to-date research and clinical research
14 literature, it would be Diabetes, Diabetes Care
15 and Diabetes Logia.

16 Q. Are you acquainted with Dr. Ralph DeFranco?

17 A. Yes, I am.

18 Q. How long have you known him?

19 A. Well, at least 25 years.

20 Q. How did you get to know him?

21 A. I got to know Dr. DeFranco through -- I
22 first met him when he was at Yale University and
23 I was at the University of Vermont, and we have
24 many common research interests. So I met him

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

128

1 through our common research. I have met him
2 through meetings. And I don't know how much
3 detail you want to go into. I gave him his first
4 ski lesson for which he has never forgiven me. I
5 met him and known him for --

6 Q. Do you folks attend diabetes conferences
7 around the world in terms of gathering of the
8 brightest minds in diabetes?

9 A. Yeah. We have seen a lot of each other in a
10 lot of meetings, and we've interacted a great
11 deal.

12 Q. Do both of you publish extensively?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Are you acquainted with a physician by the

15 name I think of Dr. Brian Tulluck?

16 A. I know Brian Tulluck.

17 Q. How do you know that gentleman?

18 A. He is head of the diabetes unit at
19 University of Texas in Houston. I have also met
20 him professionally at diabetes meetings. I have
21 actually had him as a speaker on a program that I
22 chaired so I've met him through professional
23 channels.

24 MR. GRIFFIN: Thank you very much.

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

129

1 I'll pass the witness at this time.

2 EXAMINATION BY MR. MORENO:

3 Q. Doctor, you stated your opinion with respect
4 to justification for blanket exclusion, but you
5 acknowledge again that there is a difference of
6 opinion with respect to whether there ought to be
7 blanket exclusions of individuals with insulin
8 treated diabetes mellitus?

9 A. Well, at least in the situation of the
10 pilot's license there was that, and I'm sure that
11 there's got to be a difference of opinion in
12 different areas. But I think that what we were

13 discussing earlier was specifically the comments
14 that were submitted about the proposed rules and
15 regulations for waiver for third-class airmen.

16 Q. I see.

17 MR. MORENO: That's all I have.

18 EXAMINATION BY MR. GRIFFIN:

19 Q. Doctor, have you -- are you acquainted with
20 any in your -- let me rephrase the question.

21 In your -- in the last ten years of your
22 dialog with other leaders in the field of
23 diabetes, have you ever heard any of your
24 colleagues take the position that insulin treated

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

130

1 diabetics ought to be excluded as a group from
2 serving in law enforcement positions?

3 A. I have never heard that.

4 MR. GRIFFIN: That's all, Doctor.
5 Thank you.

6 (Whereupon the deposition
7 concluded at 4:50 a.m.).

8

9

10

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

131

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

COUNTY OF BRISTOL

I, Kim M. Romaine, a Professional
Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public and for the
Commonwealth of Massachusetts, do hereby certify
that the foregoing deposition was taken before me
on May 25, 2000.

9

10 The said witness was duly sworn before the
11 commencement of his testimony; that the said
12 testimony was taken stenographically by myself
13 and then transcribed. To the best of my
14 knowledge, the within transcript is a true and
15 accurate record of said testimony.

16

17 I am not connected by blood or marriage
18 with any of the said parties, nor interested
19 directly or indirectly in the matter on
20 controversy.

21

22

23

24

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES

132

1 In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my
2 hand and Notarial Seal this 30th day of May 2000.

3

4

5

6

7 Kim M. Romaine, Notary Public
8 In and for the Commonwealth of
9 Massachusetts
10 My Commission Expires:
11 July 29, 2005
12

13 PLEASE NOTE:
14

15 THE FOREGOING CERTIFICATION OF THIS
16 TRANSCRIPT DOES NOT APPLY TO ANY REPRODUCTION OF
17 THE SAME BY ANY MEANS UNLESS UNDER THE DIRECT
18 CONTROL AND/OR DIRECTION OF THE CERTIFYING
19 REPORTER.
20
21
22
23
24

O'BRIEN & LEVINE COURT REPORTING SERVICES